

WORLD CITIES CULTURE REPORT

MAYOR OF LONDON

Contents

Mayor's foreword 5

Executive summary 7

Introduction 17

World cities and culture

The world is not flat 21

What is culture? 22

How world cities shape culture 25

Cultural strategies for world cities 28

Challenges and responses 29

What the data tells us

The cities in the report 31

About the data 32

Where next for the research? 35

Cultural heritage 36

Literary culture 41

Film and games 44

Performing arts 47

People and talent 51

Cultural vitality and diversity 53

In summary 57

City portraits

Istanbul 61

Johannesburg-Gauteng 65

London 69

Mumbai 73

New York 77

Paris 81

Shanghai 85

Sydney 89

Tokyo 93

Appendix 1: Choice of world cities 96

Appendix 2: Data tables 99

Appendix 3: Shanghai Symposium 141

Appendix 4: List of policy questions 144

Credits 147

Data tables

Figure 1. City definitions 31

Figure 2. Cultural heritage 36

Figure 3. Literary culture 42

Figure 4. Film and games 42

Figure 5. Performing arts 48

Figure 6. People and talent 48

Figure 7. Cultural vitality and diversity 54

Figure 8. Choice of world cities 97



Mayor's foreword



I am thrilled to be launching the *World Cities Culture Report 2012* – the most comprehensive report of its kind yet produced. Berlin, Istanbul, Johannesburg, London, Mumbai, New York, Paris, São Paulo, Shanghai, Singapore, Sydney and Tokyo have come together in an unprecedented global collaboration to examine the character and importance of culture in world cities.

It builds on the hugely successful 2008 report, *London: A Cultural Audit*, which looked at five of these cities. That report was translated into several languages and helped shape London's Cultural Strategy. The *World Cities Culture Report 2012* is even more ambitious. This time we wanted to extend the number of cities involved, and adopt a much more collaborative approach, providing opportunities for international policy exchange and debate. Therefore, in autumn 2011, I invited some of the world's greatest cities to join this initiative.

Why, though, are we so interested in culture's role in world cities? The report argues that the dynamism, scale and diversity of our cities make us central hubs in global culture. We are able to support a range and depth of cultural activity that other cities cannot match, which means in turn that we, more than other places, are able to harness the power of culture to contribute to wider social and economic goals.

Through this project, we have discovered that our cities have more in common than we might have thought. This report makes clear that we recognise how important culture is to our success – culture is what makes each of us unique and gives us our distinct flavour. Culture is also central to

how we address future challenges – whether it's the role of the creative industries in driving jobs and growth in London or Paris, or bridging communities in Johannesburg or Shanghai, or maintaining the international reputation of New York.

The report was launched at a summit in London held at the same time as the 2012 Olympic and Paralympic Games. This was entirely deliberate. It has been London's privilege to host the Games – and alongside the world class sport, we have staged the biggest cultural festival the capital has ever seen. This report is one expression of our belief in the value of culture.

I hope that out of the summit a new *World Cities Culture Forum* will be born. A place where cities can come together on a regular basis to share insights with one another and find new ways to work more closely together – a fitting legacy for the London Games.

I'd like to thank all of the cities for their co-operation and participation in the process. Thanks are also due to the London Cultural Strategy Group for generously supporting the project, and to BOP Consulting, the project co-ordinators, for drawing together such a compelling picture about the importance of culture in our cities.

I commend the report, and I am sure it will receive the success it deserves.

Thank you,

Executive summary



World Cities Culture Report 2012 cities: Berlin, Istanbul, Johannesburg, London, Mumbai, New York, Paris, São Paulo, Shanghai, Singapore, Sydney and Tokyo

The *World Cities Culture Report 2012* is a major global initiative on culture and the future of cities, set up by the Mayor of London. It is a celebration of world cities as crucibles of human creativity and endeavour. From ancient Athens, Renaissance Florence and Elizabethan London to modern New York's Broadway or Mumbai's Bollywood, cities have been the places where culture develops and moves forward.

This report examines the cultural offer of 12 of the world's greatest cities. It gathers evidence on 60 cultural indicators, assessing both the supply of and demand for culture, and reports on the thinking of cultural policymakers in those places. The level of detail of the cultural data collected across the cities is unprecedented, and represents the primary achievement of this research.

However, what makes the project even more valuable is its exploration of attitudes to cultural policymaking in the world cities. The potential for culture to contribute to economic and social development is understood by all the cities, but it plays out in different ways depending on the particularities of each place. Bringing an analysis of policymakers' priorities together with the data gives a much more rounded picture of culture's role in, and value to, world cities.

The research is examined in more depth over the course of this report. There are, however, a number of messages which emerge clearly.

World cities are as important in culture as they are in finance or trade

World cities, by virtue of their scale, dynamism and diversity, are the cities most able to support the widest range of cultural activity. Their large audiences (both residents and tourists) and strong private business sectors (a source both of funding for the arts and a market for creative goods) means they are able to 'specialise' in culture, supporting the high fixed costs of cultural infrastructure, as well as the other 'soft' infrastructure of commissioning, distribution, management and production. Their diversity allows them to sustain a great variety of art forms, while their dynamism – their constantly changing populations and their international connections – make the world cities hubs of new cultural ideas and knowledge, and also great centres for 'hybridised' art forms, created when ideas are blended together. The report's findings make clear that the world cities play a crucial role in global culture.

Culture is at the heart of public policy in world cities

Policymakers across the cities see culture as a central part of delivering the priorities and strategies of urban government. New York put it nicely, suggesting that culture is the 'no. 2 strategy' in all fields; there will be a strategy to address a question directly, but there is always a recognition that culture too has a major role to play in support. In Johannesburg, efforts to build social and community cohesion in the wake of apartheid have been strengthened by the development of a new heritage infrastructure that tells the history of all South Africa's peoples. In the very different context of Shanghai, culture is viewed as a source of cohesion in a city that is changing incredibly quickly. In Tokyo meanwhile, culture has been seen as an important response to the challenges posed by the 2011 earthquake, an event that has led to much soul-searching in Japan about the country's future direction.

Culture's role in supporting economic strategies is also recognised in the cities. In London and Paris the creative industries are seen as a potential source of new jobs and growth at a time of economic difficulty. Cultural activity is also an important tool in urban regeneration – New York stresses its importance in helping to revive run-down neighbourhoods.

In a globalised world, culture gives world cities a distinctive appeal

In the era of globalisation, world cities are increasingly competing with each other, rather than with other cities in their countries, for such things as the headquarters of multinational firms, or the right to host major international sporting and cultural events. Cultural prowess and economic success are increasingly seen as interlinked. Those cities with historically strong cultural offers, such as London, New York and Paris, see culture as a vital part of their economic strength. This is expressed in two ways. Firstly, the commercial forms of culture – the creative industries – make up a large and growing share of the economies of large cities. Given the challenges facing some other sectors of the economy, such as finance or public services, the creative industries represent a large source of employment, exports and tax revenue that needs to be better understood by policymakers in both the cultural and economic fields.

The second contribution of culture to urban economies is, if anything, more fundamental. Culture in all its diverse forms is central to what makes a city appealing to educated people and hence to the businesses which seek to employ them. In the globalised knowledge economy, having a well-educated workforce is the key to success, and such workers demand stimulating, creative environments. It is clear from partner cities' responses that they are well aware of culture's role in making their cities attractive to 'talent'. A rich and vibrant culture thus also becomes an indirect source of economic success.

This is recognised by cities in emerging economies as well – from Shanghai to Istanbul to São Paulo there is a belief that culture will help determine their city's future economic success.



opposite: Shanghai Dancer Fangji, courtesy of Shanghai Theatre Academy



The launch of a World Cities Culture Forum

Bringing the cities together to discuss and share ideas and experiences is an achievement in itself, one that should lead to great mutual benefits for the participating cities. While each city's culture is distinct, shaped by its own character – Sydney's relaxed, outdoors culture, for example, is heavily influenced by the city's climate and natural beauty; Tokyo's is moulded by a deep egalitarian streak in Japanese society – they nevertheless have much knowledge and experience to share. Already there is a commitment to develop a World Cities Culture Forum, to provide a more permanent basis for this work – the cultural equivalent of the G20 for world cities. It aims to:

- highlight the critical contribution of culture to the economic and social success of world cities
- build an evidence base about the many and wide-ranging ways in which culture impacts on a world city and its inhabitants
- enable learning from each other by examining common challenges and dilemmas and comparing approaches to cultural investment and development
- define a future cultural research agenda for world cities.

opposite: The ArcelorMittal Orbit, a unique fusion of art, architecture and engineering, conceived by Anish Kapoor/Cecil Balmond and funded by ArcelorMittal to provide an iconic new addition to London's skyline
Photo: London Legacy Development Corporation

A programme is being developed for the forum. It is likely to include:

- an online platform for sharing and disseminating data, information and effective practice (www.worldcitiescultureforum.com)
- an annual conference/summit, hosted on a rotating basis by member cities, focusing on a particular theme
- a World City Culture Report – published every three years as a compendium of data and effective practice
- an ongoing series of collaborative research and policy events and publications.

The forum will be launched at the Mayoral Summit in August during the London 2012 Olympic and Paralympic Games by the partner cities but will be open to other leading cities to join.

The cities

The report includes a series of portraits of nine cities. These explore policy developments and issues in each. There are three overarching challenges which face many of them. One is the battle to balance modernity and tradition, making sure that both are valued. The second is maintaining a sense of the local and specific in a globalised world, while the third is finding ways to link cultural infrastructure and participation – developing audiences for artistic work. There are also a number of more specific challenges facing each city, as well as great opportunities.

Istanbul

Istanbul has a rich history and architecture, yet in some respects is a very modern city – its population has surged in recent decades due to internal migration (often from rural areas). The challenges facing the city include boosting participation, especially among rural migrants and in peripheral areas of the city; and making the most of the city's cultural heritage and tourist potential. The city's advantages include its young, dynamic population, and its fast-growing economy. Its policymakers are keen to position it as both a city of culture and a world city.

Johannesburg-Gauteng

Johannesburg is still grappling with the legacy of apartheid. It has developed a new cultural heritage sector to tell South Africa's story more honestly, and is now turning towards the issues of increasing participation and growing audiences.

Johannesburg has lots of possibilities open to it – it may become a different type of world cultural city. The 'Nollywood' model, pioneered by the Nigerian film industry, of inexpensive, mass-produced cultural products aimed at local or Africa-wide audiences may provide an example for Johannesburg's creative industries. This may help the city to develop a distinctively African cultural model to go along with the Western one which has largely prevailed until now.



Chora Museum, Istanbul Photo: Tahsin Aydogmus, courtesy of Istanbul Directorate of Culture and Tourism

London

London's position is strong in almost every category, with a great stock of cultural infrastructure, and high participation and attendance rates. However, the UK finds itself in an increasingly tough economic environment, with pressures on both public spending and private consumption. There is an opportunity for culture and the creative industries to make London a more attractive place to live, work, invest in and visit, so supporting growth more generally and helping to 'rebalance' the economy. Hosting the Olympic and Paralympic Games this summer also provides a great opportunity to achieve a long-term cultural legacy.

Mumbai

Mumbai is a poor but rapidly growing and energetic city. Its current cultural offer is weak in a conventional sense – there is a shortage of cultural infrastructure, for instance – but the huge success of Bollywood shows what might be possible. Can the city use Bollywood as a template on which to build a successful creative sector? Are there other options for building a cultural offer, such as digital technology (a major strength of India's)?

New York

In New York, culture is seen as a visible demonstration of the world-class status of the city. Its extremely strong cultural offer is reflected throughout New York: culture is a signature industry of the city found in every borough. It is also regarded as a key to economic success, helping to attract talented workers and visitors from around the world. The city faces budgetary pressures, but is determined to maintain support for culture, especially through public/private partnerships.

Paris

Paris is looking for ways to make its 'art de vivre' work for new generations of (multicultural) residents. While proud of its cultural heritage, it is keen to avoid Paris becoming an 'open-air museum', and is building new facilities in peripheral districts and embracing new 'fringe' art forms in an effort to keep the city's culture vibrant and modern. Paris is also emphasising the economic value of creative industries to the city's future.

Shanghai

Shanghai is the largest city in the world's fastest-rising power. It has a hugely ambitious, planning-led approach to culture, building major new infrastructure for both culture and creative industries with the aim of becoming a major cultural city by 2020. For now, though, participation rates in culture are lagging.

If Shanghai is to match its economic power with equivalent cultural power, the city will have to overcome a number of challenges. These include a rapidly ageing population, a lack of diversity – the city has relatively few international students, for instance – and the need to further develop its artistic talent base.

Sydney

Sydney is a mid-sized world city, which means that in some fields it lacks the breadth of infrastructure of some of its larger peers. It compensates for this with a particularly rich informal culture – festivals for example are a great strength of Sydney's. The city also draws on its climate and natural beauty to create a relaxed, convivial, inclusive culture. It is trying to widen this inclusivity by placing more emphasis on Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander culture.

Tokyo

Tokyo's uniqueness stems from its egalitarian culture, with blurred boundaries between creators and consumers, and between 'high' and 'pop' culture. Although the city may not on the surface appear particularly diverse, in reality it has many different cultures, often associated with certain neighbourhoods. Tokyo is strong in both cultural infrastructure and participation.

The difficulties that Japanese society has faced in recent years – its slow economic growth and, especially, the aftermath of the 2011 earthquake and tsunami – have led to a reappraisal of values, and culture is increasingly seen as an important part of Tokyo's reinvention in response to these challenges.

In summary

The report is the first time that the richness of the data has been brought together with such an in-depth policy analysis. What it shows is that culture is essential to a thriving world city. It is hoped that this report will help to point towards ways of making policy and strategy in this area more effective and robust.



Introduction

World cities are customarily thought of as nodes in a global economic system: centres of finance and trade and sources of political power. But world cities are cultural powerhouses too. They excel across a range of art forms, both formal and informal, and have a variety and quality of facilities that smaller cities find difficult to match. They have large, diverse audiences for culture and attract people from across the globe who in turn bring their own cultures to add to the city's mix.

Culture's intrinsic and social values have long been recognised. However, in the last 30 years a new view of culture has arisen. It is increasingly seen as a driver of economic growth. A series of developments – among them the rise of the knowledge economy, in which skills and creativity count for more than raw materials; the growth of cultural and urban tourism; the emergence of the 'creative industries' paradigm; the theories of Richard Florida, Charles Landry and others, with their emphasis on the role of culture in attracting businesses to cities; and the contribution of the Guggenheim Museum to the regeneration of Bilbao – have led to a new focus on the value of culture within urban development. This view attributes a key role to culture in stimulating long-term economic and social growth in cities – not so much through creating short-term economic returns (though these may occur), but by shaping a sense of place and social space that increases the city's attractiveness to an educated workforce and the businesses which seek to employ them.

This has been reflected in another phenomenon of the last couple of decades: city rankings. As part

of a wider debate about the economic competitiveness of cities, most such measures have included at least a nod to culture's role in city life in the comparisons they make. However, these measures are often simplistic and based on just a handful of indicators. For example, Foreign Policy magazine's Global City Index originally used just five to get its cultural experience score in 2008. Nor are such rankings intended to inform cultural policy, as they are not underpinned by any understanding of the way culture works in cities.

Culture's contribution to the economic and social life of big cities is a topic worthy of much more systematic examination. The *World Cities Culture Report 2012* has attempted to do just that and provides an unparalleled level of detail. Culture is multi-dimensional and multi-layered; no serious analysis can reduce a city's culture to a single overall 'score' or ranking. Comparing cities' culture is valuable as it helps us understand more about their similarities and differences, their relative strengths and their perceptions of culture's role in their city's life. For this to be meaningful, it is necessary to look at a much wider variety of data to get a sense of the broad range of cultural activity. The *World Cities Culture Report 2012* does this, examining some 60 measures. These include both formal culture, which is defined as activity taking place in permanent 'cultural' venues such as museums, theatres and galleries, and informal culture, which takes place in other venues such as pubs, clubs and restaurants or outdoors, such as festivals. The report also looks at data on production, consumption, and cultural infrastructure.

The world cities in this report are very varied. Some are in the developed world, some are in emerging economies; some were imperial capitals, some were founded by colonists; some are old, some are young; some are national capitals, some are not. They were chosen because they are all cities which will help shape the direction of the world over the coming decades, and they are all interested in strengthening the role of culture.

More than 40 years ago Jane Jacobs celebrated the diversity of urban neighbourhoods such as her own Greenwich Village as places where individual creativity could flourish in an atmosphere of tolerance. Such places lie at the heart of world cities' cultural contribution. That does not mean, however, there are no challenges. Sustainability is an issue, and cultural richness is no guarantee against economic or social decline. But in world cities, we really are standing on the shoulders of giants. We have inherited the cultures of the past and add to them with the dynamism and flux of the present.

The report is structured in three main sections:

- The role of culture in world cities
- What the data tells us
- City portraits

This is followed by an appendix giving full details of the data indicators. Between them, these sections provide an unparalleled level of detail on culture in world cities.



opposite: Gigs launch, London 2012 Festival Photo: © Martyn Rourke



World cities and culture

The world is not flat

Popular accounts of globalisation assume that the world is 'flattening', becoming more homogenous, as telecommunications, air travel and the continuing spread of the English language make different places appear superficially similar. The experience of landing at a major airport to be greeted by a familiar set of advertising billboards – what the US novelist Don DeLillo calls '*the Esperanto of jet-lag*' – can lure us into thinking that distance and distinctiveness have been obliterated.

But the world is not flat, nor is distance dead. Recent United Nations (UN) reports have confirmed that more than half of the world's population lives in urban areas, and that the urban share is growing fast, particularly in the global 'South'. Some people come to cities reluctantly, driven by the age-old reason that economic opportunities are greater there. Others come, because as medieval Europeans noted, 'the city makes you free', opening up greater possibilities than those you have left behind. Still others survey the world, looking for new places to invest, to set up home, and start businesses. Telecommunications, travel and education appear to have entrenched the dominance of the city in the world economy, not weakened it.

Yet cities remain different from one another and from their rural hinterlands. Even world cities – with their superficial resemblances – remain distinctive. The reason why? Culture. What links world cities to one another is trade, commerce and finance. What makes them different from one another is culture. While world cities are plugged into global circuits

of ideas and knowledge, it is their local culture (and cultural producers) which transform these external influences into something unique.

This report focuses on 12 world cities that are also commonly regarded as leaders in culture. To be clear, the report is not saying these are necessarily the world's 12 most culturally important cities – only one city from each country has been included, for instance – nor is it a ranking. The purpose is not to say which cities are currently 'top', even less is it to prescribe what world cities should do in terms of culture. Instead, it is to try and understand the role that culture plays within the successful world city.

None of the cities featured here can be summed up in a simple soundbite: there is no single 'festival city', 'city of cinema' or 'pop music metropolis'. While many other smaller cities seek to position themselves by demonstrating their strength in a particular domain (such as the cities brought together by the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation (UNESCO)'s creative cities network), the world cities in the report contain much more than that. All of them offer music, film and festivals; all have concert halls and art galleries; and all have vast and growing informal cultural scenes that interact with, and renew, the culture of the city. For all the talk about competition between cities, the distinctive and diverse cultures of world cities are in some sense complementary: New York's cultural richness is not achieved at the expense of, say, Tokyo's – indeed, they may feed off each other.

What is culture?

The academic and critic Raymond Williams famously noted that, 'Culture is one of the two or three most complicated words in the English language'. It could be added that it is a complex subject in whatever tongue one chooses, as the definition contained in UNESCO's 2001 Universal Declaration on Cultural Diversity illustrates:

Culture should be regarded as the set of distinctive spiritual, material, intellectual and emotional features of society or a social group, and that it encompasses, in addition to art and literature, lifestyles, ways of living together, value systems, traditions and beliefs.

UNESCO

Within this definition, it is possible to discern the three distinct but interrelated usages of the term identified by Williams: culture as aesthetic forms and practices; culture as a way of life; and culture as a resource for supporting human development.

The report seeks to capture culture in this multi-dimensional sense. But it is perhaps inevitable that a statistical exercise such as this will better represent the more tangible and material forms of culture than the intangible ones.



Hagia Irene, Istanbul Courtesy of Istanbul Directorate of Culture and Tourism



How world cities shape culture

The 12 world cities are global cultural hubs not because their share of cultural activities is growing fastest – indeed it may be faster in some smaller cities or towns – but because they can afford to ‘specialise’ in culture, providing the infrastructure of commissioning, distribution, management and other professional functions that enable these sectors to get their products to market. There are three elements which characterise culture in such cities.

Dynamism

World cities are dynamic, always changing; and culture is the grit (and therefore, in time, the pearl) in the oyster. Great cities are not an outcome but a process, and are able to reinvent themselves. The constant influx of new people brings new ideas and talent to the world cities. This process of change is central to world cities’ future. An ability to make new connections – between cities, between industries, formal and informal culture, for profit and not for profit activities – is a key factor in their sustainability. The challenge for cities is to understand the ever-shifting nature of culture this produces, and to nurture its success.

We don't believe you can ever say that there is 'enough' or 'too much' culture.

New York

Culture also influences non-cultural activities. For example, design is the key to product differentiation. The way in which cultural content is now experienced across a diverse range of technological platforms is intertwined with cultural consumption – goods and services are marketed in terms of ‘design’, ‘brands’, ‘lifestyles’, and ‘experiences’.

opposite: Halloween Parade, New York

Photo: Joe Buglewicz, courtesy of NYC Department of Cultural Affairs

Scale

The wider economy of culture is growing. The United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD) reported in its *Creative Economy Report 2010* that cultural products and services are making up an ever-greater share of the world's trade and GDP, and that their rate of growth is outstripping the rest of the economy in a number of countries. Much of this economy is concentrated in cities: in some of the cities in this report, the cultural and creative sector is the second or third largest economic sector.

Size matters because in cultural markets high failure rates must be expected. Innovation 'requires' waste, experiment and tolerance of failure. This is why audiences are crucial. The world cities provide not just local audiences, but international ones, with their high numbers of tourists and business visitors. Crucially they also offer a large student population – drawn locally and from overseas – who provide both a willing market for cheap, often experimental, culture, and are creators of culture themselves.

Sydney's unique larrikin spirit, culturally and linguistically diverse community and spectacular natural beauty shapes and complements its cultural life resulting in an unusually inclusive, convivial and dynamic city.

Sydney

Diversity

Diversity in this context refers to diversity of audience, market and population, as well as diversity of cultural offerings. It is reflected in festivals and celebrations, the largest of which in cities like São Paulo, New York and Berlin attract the equivalent of almost a third of the city's population, as well as in foreign-language newspapers, books and films.

For some cities, acknowledging the diversity of their cities is a key cultural policy goal. London celebrates its 300 and more language communities, while Sydney, New York and Mumbai reflect their diversity in communal festivals.

Diversity is often displayed to its greatest extent in informal culture, and all the world cities make great play of these growing sectors that range from comedy clubs and bars to pop-up galleries and street art. The work of Chris Anderson suggested that firms could make money by addressing the countless markets for minority cultural tastes (the 'long tail' theory). This is equally true for cities, where the ability to survive initially with just a small minority audience can give an idea the 'breathing space' it needs to allow it to grow into a worldwide hit.



Peripheralscopes: looking-over to the over-looked, street art project, Sydney Photo: Sharon Hickey, courtesy of City of Sydney

Cultural strategies for world cities

World cities theory has hitherto paid relatively little attention to culture. Strategies for growth and economic development have been based on the foreign direct investment (FDI) model and have stressed elements such as transport, education, good housing stock and the rule of law. However, the effort to attract global businesses and investment can blind city governments to the need to develop the local and the particular, and to leave space for the unplanned. World cities, such as those featured in this report, increasingly recognise this.

It is important to understand not just that the cultural sector is concentrated in urban conurbations, but that much of it shapes the wider character of the city itself: its record shops, its large and small music venues, its libraries and book shops, its museums and galleries, its parks and open spaces, football clubs and cricket grounds, students and cafes. In short, a vibrant cultural sector, with its mix of the planned and the spontaneous, is a vital part of the urban experience. New York makes the point clear by stressing that of all its signature industries, 'culture is the one that is present in every borough and in every neighbourhood'.

The problem for policymakers is that these deep and interlinking assets are only sometimes the results of deliberate cultural policy. Instead they are often the legacy of education policy, transport policy, planning and licensing laws, migration and housing policy, of philanthropy and commercial hard-sell – mixed together with a variety of cultural assets, public and private. So complex is this mix that commentators sometimes fall back on the assumption that 'things just happen' in cities, or that the invisible hand of the market has worked miracles again.

But in fact the entwining of cultural policy with other urban policies is characteristic of all world cities. Culture is embedded in wider social, economic and political relations. Participating in culture can therefore have a potentially wide set of positive outcomes beyond entertainment and the aesthetic – from creating and retaining identity, building social cohesion, fostering community development and civic participation, to enhancing wellbeing and generating economic value.

In Johannesburg, for example, culture is seen as part of health and social development, a key to transforming the lives of previously marginalised citizens. In Sydney, meaningful recognition of the culture of the city's indigenous people is a major goal. In London, cultural activities are considered a vital part of education from school upwards. In Paris, alongside traditional French cultural policy goals, culture is a priority area for economic development, while in Shanghai, culture is seen as a source of social harmony and stability amidst rapid economic and social change.

This same mix is shown in the many agencies and actors that are involved in urban cultural policy. Tokyo stresses that its array of cultural activities is not sponsored by any government or single large corporation, but is supported by a variety of public cultural organisations. New York also practises the mixed economy model, with high levels of philanthropic cultural funding alongside public funding and consumer spending.

This 'embedded' nature of culture is one reason why it is inadvisable to try to develop a single blueprint that can be transplanted from one city to another. This rarely works. That said, there are certain challenges that world cultural cities appear to have in common.

Challenges and responses

There are a large number of challenges facing the 12 cities, but many of them can be grouped under three overarching themes. The first is about striking a balance between tradition and modernity. Some cities' international image is very much shaped by their historic buildings and heritage, yet they need to find a way to make sure their contemporary culture is recognised and vibrant – a question Paris is interested in. On the other hand, the international images of, say, Tokyo and Shanghai tend to overlook their historic quarters and buildings.

The second challenge is how to maintain a sense of the local and specific in a rapidly globalising world. As ideas and people move more and more freely across borders, it may become hard to keep hold of the distinctive elements of a city's culture. How can this be done without becoming parochial or protectionist?

The third challenge is how best to link infrastructure and participation. In some of the most rapidly growing cities, such as Shanghai and Istanbul, there are significant efforts being made to improve the quality of the cultural infrastructure. Some in particular, such as libraries, are potentially valuable contributors to the future skills of urban populations. However, to avoid cultural buildings being under-used, a focus is needed on participation to ensure that citizens can fully benefit from the new facilities being built for them.

The responses the world cities make to these and related challenges vary according to their circumstances. However, there are two strategic principles which seem to guide their view of culture's usefulness. The first is to emphasise culture's role as a force of renewal. This can refer to physical

regeneration, where old buildings are given new cultural uses, or where culture helps revive previously run-down neighbourhoods – such strategies can be seen in Paris, New York and London among other places. But culture also offers a chance for spiritual or emotional regeneration. In Tokyo after the 2011 earthquake, New York after 9/11, and in Johannesburg after the end of apartheid, culture has played a role in bringing a city together again and reviving its sense of purpose.

The second strategic principle shared by many of the cities is to stress the importance of partnership between the public and private sectors. In almost all the cities, culture benefits from a 'mixed' economy, where private and public elements reinforce each other. A few examples help to illustrate this point: many of New York's great cultural institutions such as the Metropolitan Museum and MoMA are managed privately but housed in buildings owned by the city. In Istanbul, state funds support private theatres, while in Tokyo public institutions often bring in private sector managers to lead the organisations, bringing in new skillsets. Such partnerships allow the cultural sector to benefit from the strengths of both private and public sectors.



We can make Johannesburg whatever we want it to be. The city is here, asking us to shape it.
Johannesburg

What the data tells us

The cities in the report

The *World Cities Culture Report 2012* builds on the work of an earlier research report, *London: A Cultural Audit* (2008). That report surveyed five cities: London, New York, Paris, Shanghai and Tokyo.

The *World Cities Culture Report 2012* adds seven other cities to this list. These were chosen using a set of objective criteria such as economic wealth and population figures (to determine the 'global importance' of a particular city) and the report authors' judgement of the importance of these players on the global cultural agenda. For a detailed description of how the cities were chosen, please see Appendix 1.

Figure 1. City definitions

City name	Corresponding administrative area	Population of administrative unit	Size of administrative unit (sq. km)
Berlin	State of Berlin	3,460,725	892
Istanbul	Istanbul province	13,624,240	5,313
Johannesburg	Gauteng province	11,328,203	18,178
London	Greater London	7,825,200	1,572
Mumbai	Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai	12,432,830	437.1
New York	New York City	8,175,133	1,214.4
Paris	Île-de-France	11,797,021	12,012
São Paulo	Prefecture of São Paulo	11,253,503	1,500
Shanghai	Shanghai Municipal District	23,474,600	6,340.5
Singapore	Nation of Singapore	5,183,700	710
Sydney	Metropolitan Region of Sydney	4,575,532	12,144.5
Tokyo	Tokyo Metropolis (Tokyo prefecture)	13,159,388	2,130

Source: BOP Consulting (2012)

Those 12 cities had different levels of engagement in the production of this report. Nine cities – Istanbul, Johannesburg, London, Mumbai, New York, Paris, Shanghai, Sydney, and Tokyo – actively participated in the data collection and portrayal of their cultural urban environment. For Berlin, São Paulo and Singapore, only data was collected.

It is important to be clear about the administrative unit that is referred to. Many cities sprawl over government boundaries, and it is sometimes unclear whether the 'city' means the city centre, its suburbs or a wider city-region. In this report each city's statistics refer to the following administrative areas, unless otherwise stated.

About the data

The 2012 report takes as its starting point a definition and framework for analysing culture that is recommended by UNESCO, and which was used in the 2008 research. This defined culture using the 'domains' and 'functions' embedded within UNESCO's (1986) Framework for Cultural Statistics. The indicators cover:

- cultural provision: categorising the range and composition of a city's cultural 'infrastructure' and tracking what these institutions produce annually
- consumption and participation: quantifying the size, nature and value of the audiences for the cultural offer of the comparator cities.

Informal culture has not typically been included in statistics but is nevertheless an important part of the picture. It affects cultural vitality (informal cultural production and consumption, together with other factors that add to the vibrancy or 'buzz' of a city as experienced at street level) and also cultural diversity (cultural production and consumption by, and for, a diverse range of demographic groups).

We also worked with each city to identify a small number of additional indicators that are of specific cultural importance to the partner cities, though it was not always possible to collect these for every city.

The report groups the data into six thematic areas, to allow for an exploration of patterns in the data. The six are:

- cultural heritage
- literary culture
- performing arts
- film and games
- people and talent
- cultural vitality and diversity.





Where next for the research?

It is worth noting that the findings are, at least to some extent, a reflection of the research and data collection practices in each city. Finding reliable, good quality data for cultural indicators across cities is challenging, and the research for this report required the use of a variety of sources, ranging from official government statistics to listings in arts and entertainment magazines. Some of the variations between cities reported in individual measures also reflect differences in definitions. For example, for the data indicator 'number of foreign films released in a country' there are different definitions of 'domestic' and 'foreign' from country to country, affected by factors such as the percentage of a film's budget coming from a particular territory.

The research has also highlighted a lack of available data for some cultural statistics, especially for some of the cities in emerging economies. Work with researchers from the Tata Institute of Social Science in Mumbai is an interesting case study in this regard. The figures for Mumbai contained in the *World Cities Culture Report 2012* cannot be found in existing reports or statistical publications. A significant amount of primary research and 'sense-checking' of contradictory figures from different sources had to be carried out, as well as estimating figures through a process of grossing-up from a sample of activity.

A number of potential indicators have had to be excluded from the analysis, because reliable data could not be collected for all the cities. This included such things as the number of archives and the number of public art installations and artist workspaces, to more culturally specific indicators such as the number of pianos owned by residents or dedicated cultural

community centres. Providing an even more rounded account of culture in world cities will require further work to improve the data.

There are four areas where more data would be valuable:

- 'informal' culture: how it works, and what its potential contribution is
- new ways of cultural consumption, including digital consumption and the reasons why and how people participate (or not) in culture
- the role of artists and other creative people in a city's social and economic fabric
- different approaches to valuing culture.

Despite these gaps, the information gathered for the 2012 report provides a rich dataset which can be analysed further in the future. It may be possible, for instance, to explore whether variables such as GDP, diversity and participation rates are related.

This research agenda will be taken forward by the World Cities Culture Forum, including in future editions of the *World Cities Culture Report*. That said, the research carried out for this 2012 report still represents a breakthrough in comparative data for world cities. Policymakers need to have more information about their city's culture in order to be effective custodians of it; this report is a big step towards that goal. The next sections discuss the findings from the research.

Cultural heritage

A city's cultural heritage can be considered to include many things. The report has considered data on museums and galleries, archives, heritage sites and public green spaces. They are all in a sense the cultural inheritance of a city, often established by previous generations of residents. As such, they reflect the city's history. Was it an imperial capital? Is it currently a national capital? The contents of many art galleries, for instance, reflect wider political or social turbulence. The core of the collection of the Dulwich Picture Gallery in London was gathered between 1790 and 1795 by two London art dealers on behalf of the King of Poland, who intended it to form a royal collection in his country. In the five years it took the dealers to build the collection, Poland was partitioned and the King forced to abdicate. Attempts to sell the pictures failed, and they ultimately came to rest in south London, where they remain to this day.

Museums and galleries are often very visible symbols of a city's cultural identity. They house their

nation's treasures. New York's Metropolitan Museum, London's British Museum, Paris's Louvre and Tokyo's National Art Center, to name but four, are among the leading tourist attractions in their cities. Nor are such places just for tourists – in the majority of the cities a third or more of the resident population visited a museum or gallery every year. The number of visitors resulting from this combination of tourists and local residents can be strikingly high. The five most popular museums and galleries in both London and Paris receive more than 20 million visits between them (though many of London's have free entry), while Shanghai's and Istanbul's 'top five' attract more than six million. 'Newer' cities too are keen to develop their museums and galleries: Singapore has more than 50 museums, and 40 per cent of its residents visit a museum or gallery each year.

It should be noted that most countries designate certain museums as 'national' museums, indicating they have particularly significant collections. Such

national museums tend to be found in a country's capital, explaining the relatively low scores on this measure for the likes of New York, Sydney and São Paulo. Despite this, all of the cities apart from Mumbai have at least 40 museums.

Turning to galleries, the figures combine public and commercial galleries, and are thus evidence both of a city's cultural legacy and the dynamism of its contemporary art market. Visual art is a field which seems to be unusually concentrated in the world's leading cities. The mix of galleries, artists, dealers, buyers and critics found in big cities provide the infrastructure for artistic activity; impressionism in Paris and abstract expressionism in New York are just two examples of art movements inextricably linked to their host city. In today's more globalised world other big cities play their part. Istanbul and São Paulo have established art biennials which have become important fixtures on the international art calendar. São Paulo's is the second-oldest in the world, after Venice's, having

started in 1951. Data from the Art Newspaper suggests that many of the world's most popular art exhibitions are held in the 12 cities covered by this report.

The rich cultural inheritance of world cities is demonstrated in other ways too. Their public green space is one such element, and the most obvious manifestation is to be found in a city's public parks. These have disparate origins – some are former royal hunting grounds, such as London's Hyde Park, while others, such as Central Park in New York, were civic initiatives. These early examples have proved influential in other countries. Ueno Park in Tokyo was one of Japan's first public parks, opening in 1873 on land previously owned by a temple. The park was developed during the Meiji period, a time when Tokyo (and Japan) was known for adopting many new ideas from outside the country. The 500,000m² park is one of the most visited in Japan, and is famous for its spring cherry blossom and the museums it contains, which include the Tokyo National Museum.

Figure 2. Cultural heritage

Indicator	Berlin	Istanbul	Johannesburg	London	Mumbai	New York	Paris	São Paulo	Shanghai	Singapore	Sydney	Tokyo
No. of national museums	18	7	9	11	4	5	24	1	27	5	1	8
No. of other museums	140	71	51	162	6	126	113	110	87	48	59	39
No. of art galleries	421	267	76	857	152	721	1046	N/A	208	252	122	688
% attending museums and galleries	N/A	N/A	8%	53.6%	N/A	N/A	43%	N/A	47.5%	40%	25.9%	33%
Visits to five most popular museums/galleries (million)	4.7	7.1	0.6	25.3	1.8	15.4	23.4	2.2	6.6	2.7	2.8	9.7
Visits to five most popular museums/galleries per capita	1.4	0.5	0.1	3.2	0.1	1.9	2	0.2	0.3	0.5	0.6	0.8
No. of World Heritage Sites	3	1	1	4	2	1	4	0	0	0	2	1
Other heritage/historical sites	8,689	30,188	281	18,901	42	1,482	3,792	12	2,049	63	783	419
% public green space (parks and gardens)	14.4%	1.5%	24%	38.4%	2.5%	14%	9.4%	N/A	2.6%	47%	46%	3.4%

Source: BOP Consulting (2012)

The value of parks to urban life continues to be recognised. New parks continue to be built, even in established cities – like New York's High Line park, built on an abandoned elevated railway, or the new Olympic Park in east London, one of the largest urban parks to be created in Europe for decades. However, the highest percentages of public green space are to be found in Sydney and Singapore, where it accounts for almost half the land area.

Heritage sites are another example of cities drawing on their cultural legacy to enliven their present. The 12 cities under review are home to 19 UNESCO World Heritage Sites, ranging from Museum Island in Berlin to the Sydney Opera House. Some of these sites contain several notable buildings. Paris's world heritage site is an extreme case, covering both banks of the Seine and including the likes of the Louvre, the Eiffel Tower, Notre Dame, Les Invalides and the Place de la Concorde, among others.

Each city also has its own designation of historically significant sites or buildings. These definitions differ in many ways, and are hence difficult to compare, but the numbers of buildings and monuments of historic importance are striking: more than 30,000 in Istanbul, almost 19,000 in London, and 9,000 in Berlin. These differences in definition often reflect different attitudes to heritage and modernity across countries. Such sites are again important both to tourists and residents, helping to give each city its distinctive character. In recent years schemes such as Heritage Open Days (in Berlin and Paris) or Open House (in London) have been devised to enable the public to have greater access to these buildings.

The uniqueness of Tokyo culture lies in the fact that so many people can participate in it as equals.
Tokyo





Literary culture

The printing press is perhaps the single most important innovation in communications technology the world has seen, and the printed book became the easiest way to communicate knowledge over long distances. Yet the printing press has also contributed to a more urban world, by spurring revolutions in thinking about politics, religion and social attitudes.

The importance of literary culture in cities is reflected in the statistics gathered for this report. Although libraries have existed for centuries – the famous ancient Library of Alexandria was built more than 2,300 years ago – genuinely public libraries, aimed at the mass of the population, are a comparatively recent phenomenon, dating from the industrial revolution and efforts to encourage greater literacy and education. Driven by government legislation, and by reformers such as Andrew Carnegie in the United States, the public library spread rapidly across the world. Even in the internet age, major new libraries continue to be built. The National Library of Singapore opened in 2005 at a cost of more than £250m and holds more than 700,000 books and other print and non-print materials.

Today, half of the 12 world cities have 200 or more public libraries, with Paris reporting the highest number. The world cities' libraries lend huge numbers of books. Seven cities lend at least 20m a year, with Tokyo lending more than 110m. Both Tokyo and New York lend more than eight books a year per head of population.

Libraries are, of course, not the only source of books and reading materials. The cities also contain thousands of bookshops. In the richer countries, bookshops are under pressure from a range of factors, such as the spread of e-books, high rents

and changing consumer taste. The numbers of shops are still significant – London has 800, while New York has 750. However, other cities report higher numbers: São Paulo has 870 and Johannesburg more than 1,000. Shanghai leads the way, with over 3,000.

The report also collected data for rare and second-hand bookshops. These were most frequently found in Johannesburg (over 900) and Tokyo (almost 700).

Statistics on publishing are hard to find for cities, though national data is available. Once again, historical accident has played a part in determining the centres of publishing. Edward Glaeser has pointed out that in the nineteenth century the big profits in American publishing came from printing pirated copies of English novels. New York's port and East Coast location meant its publishers could get hold of the English originals before their rivals in other cities, which allowed it to build up a dominant position in the industry it maintains to this day.

The number of books published has exploded in recent years. In China and the USA around 300,000 are published every year, while in the UK the figure is just over 150,000. France and Japan see more than 70,000 published annually.

(See pages 42–43 for Figure 3. Literary culture)

Figure 3. Literary culture

Indicator	Berlin	Istanbul	Johannesburg	London	Mumbai	New York	Paris	São Paulo	Shanghai	Singapore	Sydney	Tokyo
No. of public libraries	88	42	234	383	80	220	830	116	477	25	154	377
No. of public libraries per 100,000 people	2.5	0.3	2	5	0.006	3	7	1	2	0.5	3	3
No. of library book loans (million)	23.6	0.1	9.0	37.2	2.05	68	47.0	0.8	58.7	33.2	19.1	112.2
No. of library book loans per capita	6.8	<0.1	0.8	4.8	0.2	8.3	4.0	0.1	2.5	6.5	4.2	8.6
No. of bookshops	245	463	1,020	802	525	777	1,025	869	1,322	164	439	1,675
No. of bookshops per 100,000 people	7	3	9	10	4	9	9	8	15	3	10	13
No. of rare and second-hand bookshops	4	N/A	943	68	6	99	282	90	343	12	93	681
No. of book titles published in country	93,124	34,863	3,653	151,969	82,537	302,410	74,788	57,600	328,387	N/A	8,602	78,501

Source: BOP Consulting (2012)

Figure 4. Film and games

Indicator	Berlin	Istanbul	Johannesburg	London	Mumbai	New York	Paris	São Paulo	Shanghai	Singapore	Sydney	Tokyo
No. of cinemas	94	118	47	108	105	117	302	45	230	34	67	82
No. of cinema screens	266	501	368	566	232	501	1003	282	670	239	295	334
No. of cinema screens per million people	77	38	33	73	19	61	85	25	28	47	64	25
No. of cinema admissions (millions)	9.1	10.3	13.1	41.6	10.9	N/A	58.2	50	22.9	22.1	2.3	29.3
No. of cinema admissions per capita	2.6	0.8	1.3	5.3	0.9	N/A	4.9	4.4	1.0	4.4	4.8	2.2
No. of films released theatrically in country	508	254	203	557	3,781	610	575	303	252	352	342	799
No. of foreign films released theatrically in country	315	184	21	438	298	N/A	305	228	60	N/A	306	358
No. of film festivals	33	35	16	61	6	57	190	29	2	N/A	36	35
Attendance at most popular film festival	484,860	150,000	7,500	132,000	100,000	410,000	151,800	250,000	260,000	N/A	110,000	121,010
No. of video games arcades	N/A	18	11	44	278	17	14	N/A	587	N/A	10	997

Source: BOP Consulting (2012)

Film and games

Cinema is another product of the industrial revolution. Precursors to the new medium began to appear in the late nineteenth century, and the Lumière brothers showed their first projected pictures in Paris in 1895. The technology quickly spread and developed, and within a matter of years had become a hugely popular form of mass entertainment. After initially being shown in fairs and travelling shows, the emergence of the nickelodeon in the United States foreshadowed the rise of the modern cinema – a venue dedicated to film.

Film production is a widely dispersed activity. Its 'capital', Los Angeles, is not one of the 12 cities under review here. Nevertheless, many of the 12 have had, and continue to have, significant roles in filmmaking, often being home to major studio complexes. One of them, Mumbai, is now believed to make more films than any other city in the world. This section does not, however, focus on film production. Instead, the report looks at film consumption, the opportunities to watch film.

The statistics suggest that, more than a century on from the Lumière brothers, Paris' love affair with the cinema continues. It has more cinemas (302), and more cinema screens (1,003), than any other city. Per head of population, London, Berlin and Sydney are also well-served for cinema screens. While Paris also has the highest number of cinema admissions, with 58 million, London's admissions per head of population are slightly higher.

All the cities in the report have access to a wide range of films. The data on the number of films released theatrically each year is only available at a national level, but it shows that Indian audiences have more films a year to choose from than any other

country by some distance (3,700). Other countries are less prodigious in their consumption, but still have at least 200 films a year to choose from. A high percentage of these films come from overseas. In the three Western European cities and in São Paulo, Sydney and Istanbul, more than half the films released are classed as foreign.

Film festivals are another indicator of the role film plays in a city's culture, and offer further evidence of the diversity of film offerings in a city – many of the films shown at festivals will not get full theatrical releases. Berlin, New York, Tokyo and London all host major film festivals, but once again it is Paris which tops the list in terms of sheer numbers, with 190, many taking place at community or neighbourhood level. The best-attended single festival in the cities under review, though, is Berlin's Berlinale.

Film is not the only form of audio-visual art. Video games have emerged as a new form in recent decades, and the data suggests they are particularly important in Asian cities. Tokyo has almost 1,000 video games arcades, while Shanghai has almost 600 and Mumbai close to 300. Cities outside Asia generally have fewer than 50. In part this reflects differences in culture – pachinko parlours have long been a distinctive feature of Tokyo life, and this has carried over into video games arcades.

(See pages 42–43 for Figure 4. Film and games)



Daniel Craig stars as James Bond in London-shot *Skyfall* © Eon/MGM/Sony



Performing arts

Performing arts is a wide-ranging category. The report has included measures on theatre, music, comedy and dance. These art forms are in some respects the essence of urban culture, as they only flourish where people with artistic talent and technical skills can be brought together with audiences large enough to support their activities. As a result, performance traditions have developed in certain cities that have endured for centuries. London, for example, has been a great centre for theatre since the late sixteenth century, when Shakespeare, Marlowe, Kyd and others began writing their plays and establishing their companies.

The sheer scale and diversity of world cities provides a wide range of potential audiences for a huge variety of 'live' performance. This audience is big enough to support large venues such as theatres or opera houses. However, world cities also have many informal, indoor and outdoor performance spaces, often in bars, pubs, or restaurants, and many forgotten or hidden spaces, which can be used by, for instance, site-specific theatre productions. As such, they provide a mix of venues that allows these art forms to flourish in ways that are less possible in smaller towns or cities.

The data confirms that theatre remains vibrant in major cities. New York has 420 theatres, while Paris has 353 and Tokyo has 230. London follows these three, with 214. The number of theatrical performances is considerable. The total in New York is estimated at 43,000, with 32,000 in London and more than 20,000 each in Paris and Tokyo. However, theatre attendance is highest in New York at over 28 million, although London reports 14 million a year just for theatres that are members of SOLT (Society

of London Theatres), which are mostly the West End commercial theatres.

Many of the cities also have significant numbers of live music venues. Some of this activity takes place in major concert halls, which often have a focus on classical or orchestral music. Tokyo and New York each have fifteen of these. They are, however, just the tip of the iceberg in terms of the number of venues.

Paris, Tokyo and London each have close to, or more than, 350 live music venues, with New York and Berlin having more than 200. Estimating the number of music performances is not straightforward, but the figures suggest Paris has more than 30,000 in a year, ahead of New York, Tokyo and London.

Comedy as a distinct genre with its own venues is only a couple of decades old, with wide variations across the cities. However, there are thousands of performances in New York, London, Paris and Tokyo. In the cities of the emerging economies, by contrast, such performances are counted in the hundreds.

Dance performances are more evenly spread. New York has significantly more than any of the other cities (6,300) but behind it Paris, London, Shanghai, Tokyo and Singapore have at least 1,500 a year. In many cases this level of activity is built on high levels of participation in dance by non-professionals.

(See pages 48–49 for Figure 5. Performing arts)

Figure 5. Performing arts

Indicator	Berlin	Istanbul	Johannesburg	London	Mumbai	New York	Paris	São Paulo	Shanghai	Singapore	Sydney	Tokyo
No. of theatres	56	184	24	214	120	420	353	116	97	55	73	230
No. of theatre performances	6,900	6,349	5,000	32,448	8,750	43,004	26,676	N/A	15,618	2,421	4,966	24,575
No. of theatre admissions (million)	2.4	2.4	1.7	14.2	2.7	28.1	5.7	N/A	0.6	0.6	0.7	12
No. of theatre admissions per 100,000 people	0.7	0.2	0.2	1.8	0.2	3.5	0.5	N/A	0.3	0.1	0.2	0.9
No. of live music venues	250	91	46	349	98	277	423	294	44	N/A	69	385
No. of major concert halls	2	6	13	10	2	15	15	7	4	8	4	15
No. of music performances	N/A	N/A	7,400	17,108	593	22,204	33,020	N/A	3,356	2,418	1,014	15,617
No. of comedy performances	N/A	N/A	508	11,388	217	11,076	10,348	300	N/A	416	432	8,452
No. of dance performances	111	154	250	2,756	130	6,292	3,172	100	1,686	1,572	283	1,598
No. of non-professional dance schools	104	98	36	618	N/A	682	715	29	438	89	441	748

Source: BOP Consulting (2012)

Figure 6. People and talent

Indicator	Berlin	Istanbul	Johannesburg	London	Mumbai	New York	Paris	São Paulo	Shanghai	Singapore	Sydney	Tokyo
No. of specialist public cultural HE establishments	5	N/A	N/A	11	18	N/A	30	2	5	N/A	2	1
No. of specialist private cultural HE establishments	12	N/A	24	46	N/A	12	73	4	18	2	20	16
No. of students at specialist public Art & Design institutions	5,091	N/A	N/A	34,920	1,375	N/A	14,024	N/A	13,324	N/A	15,571	24,120
No. of students of Art & Design degree courses at generalist universities	N/A	774	9,066	15,745	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	43,501	7,660	13,972	25,444

Source: BOP Consulting (2012)



People and talent

Cities are, of course, not simply collections of buildings or institutions. Their lifeblood is their population and their openness to the ideas and energy new people can bring. This report attempts to measure some of the cultural dynamism inherent in successful cities by considering their human capital.

Most of the 12 cities have a number of publicly funded specialist cultural higher education institutions. These can be very expensive to run, but they are an expression of the value placed on cultural skills by society. In most countries such institutions are heavily concentrated in the largest cities. It is also useful to look at privately funded institutions, to reflect the different ways in which higher education is organised in any given country. However, in some of the cities, such as Istanbul, New York and Johannesburg, art faculties in the public education sector are contained within public generalist universities.

The subjects covered by these specialist institutions tell us something about the cultural forms that are most valued by a particular city or country. While most cities have specialist schools for performing arts (music, drama and dance) and the fine arts, Berlin and Paris also have specialist universities for film, Tokyo has one for fashion, London has one for design, and Mumbai and Paris have ones for architecture.

Despite having a smaller number of institutions than some of the others, London has almost 35,000 students in specialist art and design institutions – more than any other city. Shanghai by contrast has 43,000 studying art and design at generalist universities, again reflecting different approaches to higher education.

(See pages 48–49 for Figure 6. People and talent)

The sheer number of different cultures in London has an effect on both its citizens and on visitors. At street level, it enables punks, Goths and business people to inhabit the same space.

London



Cultural vitality and diversity

The human capital of a city helps to drive its vitality and diversity. These are hard to capture in a single indicator, so the report has compiled a number of measures looking at different aspects of the less formal entertainment and 'street life' of the cities.

These factors might be thought of as measuring the 'buzz' of a city. Buzz matters because it shapes many of the perceptions of a city for residents and tourists alike, and it may also have beneficial economic effects. The academic Richard Florida has argued that an open-minded, diverse, exciting culture makes a city attractive to educated and creative workers and hence to the businesses that want to employ them. His views remain controversial, but there is little doubt that a lively and energetic street life can be evidence of a city's wider strengths – the safety and vibrancy of its neighbourhoods; the willingness of its communities to mix; the degree of civic pride felt by residents; and the desire to come together in communal celebrations in an increasingly individualistic world. A city's residents are both observers and participants in its street life.

The first aspects of cultural vitality the report looked at were night clubs, discos and dance halls. Defining these precisely is a challenge, but the figures suggest that São Paulo and Shanghai were particularly strong in this field, with around 2,000 each. Among the richer cities, New York led the way, with 584. Bars too are a feature of the more informal culture of a city, and therefore difficult to quantify, especially in cities such as São Paulo and Johannesburg. Tokyo reports the highest number (14,000), well ahead of the remaining cities.

Food is often regarded as a central aspect of culture in the wider sense of the word. The world

cities have strikingly large numbers of restaurants. Tokyo has 150,000 eating places, while London has 37,000 and New York and Paris have over 20,000. Johannesburg and São Paulo have over 10,000. Michelin has a long-established star system for rating restaurants. It only operates in five of the cities on the list, but it confirms Tokyo's dominance – the Japanese capital has more Michelin-starred restaurants than the other four cities put together.

Street festivals are another example of a city's vitality. Sydney is particularly strong in this respect, having more festivals than New York or London (perhaps a reflection of its climate and natural beauty). Attendances at major festivals can be enormous: São Paulo's Carnival attracts four million people, equivalent to more than a third of the city's population.

opposite: The Vault at Pfaff's, New York City

Photo: Alexander Thompson, courtesy of NYC Department of Cultural Affairs

The 12 world cities are major destinations for international tourists. Such visitors are an indicator of the appeal of a particular city and its culture, but also contribute to it. International tourists make up a significant slice of the audience for many cultural attractions in world cities. London receives the most international tourists of our world cities – over 15 million. Paris and Singapore follow, with 13.3 million and 11.6 million respectively.

Diversity matters to the culture of world cities for a number of reasons. Firstly, new arrivals bring their own culture with them, something that is seen most obviously in the wide variety of ethnic restaurants which characterise most world cities. Secondly, new arrivals can also act as bridges between their city and their land of origin, speeding the exchange of ideas and experiences. Finally, perhaps the greatest cultural benefit stems from the meeting of cultural forms. Few artistic innovations are entirely new. In most cases they are hybrids, drawing on and mixing

elements from different sources to create something distinctive. By increasing the number of 'available' ideas and approaches, diversity thus encourages this mixing and innovation.

Many of the cities are strikingly diverse (especially the English-speaking ones). In London, New York, Sydney and Singapore more than a quarter of the current population is foreign-born. Other cities have experienced waves of immigration in earlier decades, giving them very diverse populations now. São Paulo's people, for example, are the descendants of Europeans, Africans and Asians who came to (or were forcibly brought to) the city in the last 200 years.

Although the report has not been able to collect statistics for this, it should also be noted that many of the world cities also receive considerable in-migration from other parts of their home country. Istanbul, for example, has seen substantial migration in recent decades from rural areas of Anatolia.

Cultural diversity is of the essence for human beings, just as biodiversity maintains biological balance.
Shanghai

Figure 7. Cultural vitality and diversity

Indicator	Berlin	Istanbul	Johannesburg	London	Mumbai	New York	Paris	São Paulo	Shanghai	Singapore	Sydney	Tokyo
No. of night clubs, discos and dance halls	152	N/A	130	337	29	584	190	2,000	1,865	56	75	73
No. of bars	1,247	657	N/A	2,143	543	7,224	3,350	N/A	1,320	576	661	14,184
No. of bars per 100,000 people	36	5	N/A	27	4	88	30	N/A	6	11	14	108
No. of restaurants	4,885	1,508	15,000	37,450	13,205	24,149	22,327	12,500	55,614	2,637	4,554	150,510
No. of restaurants per 100,000 population	141	11	133	478	11	295	189	111	237	51	99	1,144
No. of festivals/celebrations	63	136	82	254	34	309	360	N/A	33	N/A	312	485
Attendance at most popular festival	1,360,000	N/A	67,829	1,500,000	2,000,000	2,500,000	1,500,000	4,000,000	306,000	N/A	653,000	1,270,000
No. of international students	21,805	6,643	37,067	99,360	1,500	60,791	96,782	15,432	43,016	91,500	N/A	43,188
No. of international tourists	2,871,000	8,057,879	3,988,335	15,216,000	2,195,000	8,380,000	13,300,000	1,600,000	8,511,200	11,641,700	2,610,000	5,940,000
No. of int. tourists as % of city population	83%	59.1%	35.2%	194.5%	17.7%	102.5%	112.7%	14%	36.3%	224.6%	57.0%	45.1%
% foreign-born population	13.2%	N/A	5.7%	30.8%	1.4%	36.8%	12.4%	N/A	0.9%	26.9%	34.4%	2.4%

Source: BOP Consulting (2012)



In summary

The data suggests that the legacy effects of cities' cultural inheritance (the fact that some cities have benefited from centuries of investment in cultural infrastructure and promotion of cultural activities) can be persistent. This effect is obvious in infrastructure. As cities in emerging economies grow richer, these gaps are likely to reduce, but they may take many years to close. Though they may eventually do so – New York has, over time, caught and passed London and Paris on many indicators. Some emerging cities have ambitious plans in this area: Shanghai, for example, intends to build or develop new facilities at the Palace of Chinese Arts, Shanghai Contemporary Arts Museum, Shanghai Expo Museum and the Shanghai Children's Art Theatre in the next few years.

However, infrastructure is not the only measure of culture. Researchers in developed economies have only latterly woken up to the importance of informal culture, suggesting that such activity – festivals, for example – is an increasingly important driver of a city's appeal to residents and businesses alike. In this domain, the gap between the older, richer cities and those of the emerging economies is smaller, and on some of these indicators the emerging cities outscore the older cities – in part, because they are often larger. These wider measures of vitality and diversity suggest that the world cities are more balanced culturally than simple counts of, say, museums would indicate.

However, even if informal activity is strong, and the cultural infrastructure is improving, there is a third dimension: participation in culture. Here the figures suggest that the more established world cities of London, New York, Tokyo and Paris still lead the way

in terms of number of performances and audiences. Culture ultimately has to engage with the mass of the people if it is to become a dynamic force in the life of the city.

This was eloquently described by Tokyo. They note that culture has traditionally been seen as egalitarian not elitist: 'the culture of Japan has always been the domain of the common citizen'. This is expressed in a number of ways, notably the lack of clear boundaries between professional and amateur activities, and enables widespread public cultural participation.

This ambition to broaden participation as much as possible is perhaps something that all cities working to integrate culture into their urban landscape can aspire to.

The full data tables for all indicators can be found in Appendix 2.



City portraits

The report now turns to a series of short portraits of nine cities, exploring some of the recent developments in these cities, and the context in which cultural policy is made. These portraits are drawn in part from the responses cities gave to a series of policy questions and their presentations at the Shanghai Symposium. The list of questions asked can be found in Appendix 4. The cities are discussed in alphabetical order: Istanbul, Johannesburg, London, Mumbai, New York, Paris, Shanghai, Sydney and Tokyo.

Istanbul



Istanbul province

Geographical area: 5,313 sq. km

Total population: 13,624,240

Percentage of total national population living in the city: 18.2%

Education level – percentage with degree level or higher: 9.2%

GDP per capita in 2008 (PPP): US\$13,359

Percentage creative industries employment: N/A

Istanbul is both an ancient and modern city. Its first Neolithic settlements date from 8,500 years ago. The Greeks founded Byzantium there in 700 BC, before it became, as Constantinople, the eastern capital of the Roman Empire, and then the capital of the Ottoman Empire for almost five centuries. Now, although Istanbul is no longer a capital, it is the largest city of a fast-growing nation-state. Its location on the Bosphorus makes it a bridge between Europe and Asia.

Istanbul's history and thus culture is apparent in its buildings. The city's architecture mixes Western and Eastern styles. There are a few surviving Roman relics, such as the Hippodrome, Basilica Cistern and Column of Constantine, while the Genoese bequeathed the Galata Tower. However, it is the Byzantine and Ottoman buildings which define the city. Perhaps the most notable Byzantine one is the Hagia Sophia, which stood as the world's largest cathedral for a thousand years, before being turned into a mosque under Ottoman rule. Today Hagia

Sophia is a museum. The many great Ottoman buildings include the Topkapi Palace – for centuries the residence and administrative centre of the Ottoman sultans, now also a museum – and the Blue and Süleymaniye Mosques. The international significance of many of the sites is recognised by their inclusion in UNESCO's 'Historic Areas of Istanbul' World Heritage Site.

Istanbul is, though, very much a modern city as well. Internal migration from rural parts of Turkey has led to a surge in the city's population in recent decades, and it is now home to 20 per cent of Turkey's people. It generates 22 per cent of the country's GDP and takes 40 per cent of its tax revenues. Almost all of Turkey's major cultural and creative businesses have their headquarters in the city, while 49 per cent of visits to museums and 30 per cent of cultural performances in Turkey take place there.

Istanbul's contemporary culture is attracting increasing attention. It was one of the European Capitals of Culture in 2010. Many festivals, exhibitions and events were held, and two new museums were developed: the Museum of the Princes' Islands, and the Museum of Innocence, established by the Nobel Prize-winning novelist Orhan Pamuk, which uses films, photos and other memorabilia to document daily life in Istanbul from the 1950s to the present day.

Istanbul's growing cultural impact is also reflected in the rising status of its Biennial, which started in 1987. It brings together Turkish and foreign artists, and has quickly established itself as a major event

opposite: Halic, Istanbul

Photo: Bekir Baki Aksu, courtesy of Istanbul Directorate of Culture and Tourism



on the international visual art circuit. Nowadays it is ranked alongside the older São Paulo and Sydney biennials in prestige.

The national Ministry of Culture and Tourism sponsors a range of activity in the city including theatre and the film industry, as well as festivals, concerts, exhibitions, conferences and fairs. The Istanbul Metropolitan Municipality also supports culture, with one of its goals being to spread access to cultural services out to the city's peripheries. Istanbul's private sector in the city is also increasingly involved in culture, with large companies and banks in particular keen to invest in art.

Cultural policy in Istanbul is shaped by a number of bodies. The main goals for cultural policy are to improve access and participation, to help social cohesion, and to realise economic benefits. However, the city faces challenges in achieving these ambitions. Cultural consumption is low, and few people are in the habit of visiting museums or attending cultural events. Libraries in particular are under-used. Public investment has been concentrated on cultural centres and on restoring cultural heritage. While the city has a number of public theatres, the OECD has pointed out that 'for a city of its size, it possesses a remarkably low number of small theatres and other purpose-built spaces for arts, literature and music'. The OECD also thought Istanbul was not exploiting its cultural heritage assets sufficiently.

That said, the city also has considerable strengths – its growing wealth, its position as Turkey's cultural leader and pioneer, and the increasing interest in the arts and culture, and most of all, its young, dynamic population. Istanbul is tapping into this energy and dynamism by rapidly integrating with other cities of culture, and its policymakers are positioning it as a 'global city'.

opposite: Hagia Sophia, Istanbul

Photo: Gungor Ozsoy, courtesy of Istanbul Directorate of Culture and Tourism

Istanbul Metropolitan Municipality:
www.ibb.gov.tr/en-US
Istanbul Foundation For Culture And Arts:
www.iksv.org/en



Johannesburg-Gauteng

Gauteng province

Geographical area: 18,178 sq. km

Total population: 11,328,203

Percentage of total national population living in the city: 22.4%

Education level – percentage with degree level or higher: 32%

GDP per capita in 2008 (PPP): US\$9,710

Percentage creative industries employment: 4.5%

to respond to these questions – as the Johannesburg DJ/experimental rock outfit, BLK JKS Soundsystem, says ‘the city is here, asking us to shape it’.

For now at least, cultural policy in the city (and the wider Gauteng city-region) prioritises a balanced approach to social and economic development, as well as destination marketing. As the arts, culture and heritage directorate of the City of Johannesburg puts it: ‘the Directorate is largely driven by an agenda that sees its key output being its capacity to impact favourably on social cohesion, the reduction of poverty and the rapid transformation of the apartheid City legacy’.

Johannesburg-Gauteng seems in some respects to be two cities when it comes to culture. The city is part of the international cultural scene in some aspects of ‘high’ culture. It has produced a number of notable artists, writers, actors and filmmakers; while some of its cultural organisations, such as the Market theatre, have acquired international reputations for their work. For now at least, though, consumption of such art remains concentrated among the wealthier segments of society, especially the top ten per cent.

Johannesburg’s attitude to cultural development is shaped by its desire to boost participation among the other 90 per cent. It has sought to do so particularly through promoting festivals and carnival

Johannesburg-Gauteng¹ is uniquely positioned as a city-region that straddles the developed and developing world, and serves as a creative, cultural and commercial gateway to the rest of the continent. It is a driver and hub for cultural and creative production, generating new cultural forms, new modes of production and consumption, and new organisational and business models.

The culture of the city has been profoundly shaped by the years of apartheid. How to deal with the legacy of that time remains the single greatest challenge to the city’s cultural policymakers. Are ‘Western’ and ‘African’ notions of culture distinct or different expressions of universal values? Should Johannesburg try to compete with other world cities, adopting a similar agenda, or should it follow its own path? And as Johannesburg itself changes – it has become a magnet for immigrants from across Africa, for instance – how can its culture reflect those changes? The city in a sense has a blank canvas on which to work

1. Johannesburg now forms part of one continuous urban development which includes three Metros (Johannesburg, shwane and Ekurhuleni) and two District Municipalities (Sedibeng and West Rand) within the Gauteng province, and a number of municipalities around Gauteng. This emergent megacity has acquired a distinct identity as the Gauteng City Region and has become increasingly important in policymaking terms.

programming, and the development of cultural infrastructure in under-served parts of the city-region. While the creation of new infrastructure has been a priority, new considerations related to investment in people and activity and the maximising of existing infrastructure are increasingly being foregrounded.

There have been several major developments in cultural facilities since 1994. In particular, a 'new' heritage infrastructure has been realised, one which better reflects the history of South Africa's people and the struggle against apartheid. Among the key sites are Constitution Hill, the location of a former prison where Nelson Mandela was once held and now home to three museums and the Constitutional Court; Freedom Park in Tshwane, which includes a memorial and museum telling the story of South Africa; the Hector Pieterson Memorial and museum, which commemorates the history of the Soweto uprising of 1976; the Apartheid Museum; the Maropeng/Cradle of Humankind world heritage site; Walter Sisulu Square in Kliptown in Soweto; the Human Rights Precinct in Sedibeng, and Chancellor House, the original office of Nelson Mandela's law firm. Johannesburg is also building a Holocaust and Genocide Centre.

There are a handful of other cultural venues under development, sometimes undertaken in partnership with the private sector. They include a new art gallery in Sandton and a Centre for Contemporary Design on the east end of the old inner city. The most notable is the Soweto theatre. This striking building is the first theatre to be built in a township, and is part of an effort to raise the quality of life in Soweto to compare with the rest of Johannesburg. It contains three theatre spaces, the largest of which has 630 seats, and an outdoor amphitheatre, which can accommodate 3,500. It will be a flagship for the growth in cultural activity Soweto is seeing.

Like most other world cities Johannesburg-Gauteng is also keen to promote festivals and events: examples include Joburg Art Fair, Dance Umbrella, Joy of Jazz, and Arts Alive, as well as carnivals and the Food-Wine-Design Fair. There are also efforts underway to improve libraries and strengthen arts development organisations.

The city-region has also developed a number of creative and cultural 'precincts' – neighbourhoods with a mix of residential, retail and office developments which act as hubs for the incubation, production and consumption of creative and cultural goods and services. These precincts – Newtown, Maboneng, Auckland Park, and Juta Street are perhaps the best-known – involve a mix of public and private investment and bring together informal and formal culture, embodying some of the most dynamic aspects of Johannesburg's culture.

In some sectors, such as music, dance and film, a 'Nollywood' model of production is emerging, based on low-cost but large-scale production, aimed primarily at a domestic (or Africa-wide) audience. (Nollywood is the nickname for the Nigerian film industry, which pioneered this model.) As Africa grows richer, such models have the potential to create distinctively African forms of mass culture. The economic value of these industries is increasingly being recognised in Johannesburg, a city which suffers from high rates of under-employment and unemployment.

Much attention has been given to research and policymaking in Johannesburg and Gauteng over the last decade. One of the results of this has been an ambitious and ongoing programme of public art development in the Johannesburg Metro based on a percent for art model. Another area that has received major attention is creative and cultural



Soweto Theatre, Johannesburg Photo: Peter Hassall

industries development. A mapping study in 2008 generated an evidence base for a Creative Industries Development Framework for the city-region. This has led to targeted support from the Gauteng government for a range of industry development initiatives and institutions such as the Gauteng Film Commission, the Joburg Art Fair, Moshito (a music business think-tank-cum-expo) and SA Fashion Week, all of which have played a powerful role in promoting Gauteng as a nexus for both creative commerce and business intelligence.

The rationalisation of the city-region's strategic heritage and cultural tourism infrastructure and the collaboration between government departments responsible for tourism and arts and culture, has sought to give impetus to the review and implementation of the aforementioned framework. The development of a national Heritage and Cultural Tourism Strategy, designed to guide and provide

direction to the development and promotion of heritage and cultural tourism, has also brought related policy and marketing issues into sharper focus within the city-region. Cultural tourism is now being prioritised through the implementation of the Gauteng Tourism Sector Strategy.

For the city-region, culture has often been a way to address some of the bitter legacies of its singular history. The challenge for it now is to find ways to effectively tap into the other potential benefits culture can offer its people, while not neglecting its 'healing' role in society. Its policymakers, artists and audiences have the opportunity to reimagine the city – to follow their own path to create something unique.

Gauteng Tourism Authority: www.gauteng.net
Gauteng City-Region Observatory: www.gcro.ac.za
Johannesburg Live: www.jhblive.com



London

Greater London

Geographical area: 1,572 sq. km

Total population: 7,825,200

Percentage of total national population living in the city: 12.6%

Education level – percentage with degree level or higher: 41.9%

GDP per capita in 2008 (PPP): US\$65,800

Percentage creative industries employment: 12%

and diverse cities on the planet and is a key node in global finance and commercial networks. These global links help make London an outward-looking city, and are increasingly seen as a source of creative ideas and energy: London's excellent art and design schools, for instance, have attracted a wave of foreign talent, many of whom have chosen to stay.

In culture too London is a powerhouse. From Shakespeare's time it has been perhaps the world's most important city for theatre, while its great writers, from Chaucer to Johnson to Dickens, have helped shape the development of new literary forms. The city is now a major centre for a host of other art forms, including music, dance and art, while its leading museums and galleries are among the most visited in the world.

For London, the challenge will be maintaining its status as a leading player in global culture at a time when Britain must compete economically with emerging nations, and there are reductions in public subsidy for the arts. The opportunity, conversely, is for culture and the creative industries to make London a more attractive place to live, work, invest in, and visit, supporting growth more generally.

Culture is strongly supported in the city: the Mayor of London's Cultural Strategy says that 'arts and culture are fundamental hallmarks of a civilised society and all governments have a responsibility to invest in and support them for the common good of their citizens'. Opinion poll evidence also suggests that Londoners value their city's cultural life highly.

The 2012 Games should help to reinforce Londoners' pride in their city's culture. London's original bid promised the biggest ever Cultural

London is a city that combines a sense of history with cutting-edge creativity and a dynamic pop culture. As one of the most cosmopolitan and tolerant capitals in the world today, it attracts a genuine diversity of people – from radical activists to business leaders, intellectuals to fashionistas.

The city was already emerging as an international centre of trade and commerce 400 years ago. Its power only grew over the following centuries, as it became an imperial capital with the establishment of the British Empire, before the Industrial Revolution further fuelled its growth in the nineteenth century. This led to London becoming the world's largest city by population by 1900, with 6.7 million residents.

The twentieth century was a period of dramatic change for the city. Two world wars – the second of which saw London repeatedly bombed – the loss of Empire, mass immigration, and the emergence of the City as a global centre of finance have transformed the capital. London is now one of the most connected



Powerless Structures, Fig.101 2012 by Elmgreen and Dragset, for the Mayor of London's Fourth Plinth Programme
Photo: James O'Jenkins

Olympiad, and as the Games approach, the Olympiad will reach its climax with the London 2012 Festival, a ten-week cultural celebration. The festival will act both as a showcase for London talent and as an opportunity to bring many international artists to the city. The Games will also leave a significant cultural legacy, notably the Queen Elizabeth Olympic Park, which will be one of the largest new urban parks in Europe for many years and will become a major new venue for events and festivals, and Anish Kapoor's major new sculpture, the ArcelorMittal Orbit at the centre of the Olympic Park, which has the potential to become a new visitor attraction.

Nevertheless, the city's cultural institutions will face a tougher time after the Games. Economic problems may affect the demand for cultural products and services. In this climate, what are the city's strengths?

There are several. Critical mass is one. As the data tables suggest, London has a huge stock of cultural assets, and efforts continue to strengthen that cultural legacy. Thanks to both National Lottery funding and private sector support, a range of major venues have either been built or refurbished in the last 10–15 years. These include the Great Court of the British Museum, the Royal Opera House, Tate Modern, Kings Place,

the Whitechapel Gallery, the British Film Institute, the Roundhouse, the Circus Space in Hoxton and the O2 (formerly the Millennium Dome). Some ambitious schemes are still underway, such as further extensions at the British Museum, Tate Modern and the refurbishment of Tate Britain. There is also an increasing focus on improvements to the built environment around major sites. Exhibition Road, the home of three national museums, has recently undergone a major redesign to create a much more pedestrian-friendly location and improve visitors' experiences.

Over the last 20 years, the publicly funded sector has also diversified its sources of income, developing a healthy commercial instinct and ability to raise funds, which enables it to be more resilient than counterparts in other cities.

Informal street culture also continues to be a major source of strength. The last decade has seen a growth in festivals, carnivals and fairs. Examples include music festivals such as the Wireless festival in Hyde Park, Lovebox in Victoria Park, the Mayor's Thames Festival and the Greenwich and Docklands International Festival. These have added to long-established celebrations, notably the Notting Hill Carnival, now thought to be Europe's biggest such event, and New Year's Eve, which has been given a new focal point at the London Eye.

Commercially oriented art fairs have also emerged in recent years, including the Frieze Art Fair, which has become a major stop on the world's visual art circuit, and Collect, which has quickly become a globally significant event for high-end craft. Art projects in the public realm, like the temporary commissions on the Fourth Plinth in Trafalgar Square have also significantly grown in importance.

Other strengths of the city include the high quality of design, art and fashion schools: the London Design

Festival celebrates its tenth anniversary in 2012 and the model has been copied elsewhere, while London Fashion Week is part of the international fashion calendar alongside Paris, New York and Milan. The size and commercial dynamism of its creative industries (film production, inward investment and box office all broke the £1 billion barrier for the first time in 2011) and its dense, heavily-used public transport infrastructure, which is currently being upgraded, are equally strengths the city can draw on. There is also a strong concern to continually champion cultural education and the importance of home-grown talent. Further areas for development include maximising the potential of cultural tourism, and developing a more balanced cultural offer and participation across the whole of London, rather than just in the central zone.

A final, immensely significant strength is London's diversity and youthful energy. The sheer number of cultures in London perhaps gives it a different 'feel' from other cities – more free, more tolerant, more relaxed about difference, and more accepting of failure (which according to Jimmy Wales, the founder of Wikipedia and now a London resident, is essential for innovation). The Mayor of London recognises the value of this diversity and energy, and has a programme in place to support festivals such as Chinese New Year, St Patrick's Day, and Vaisakhi, as well as new initiatives such as Shubbak, a festival of contemporary Arab culture.

Culture, then, adds to London's social and economic dynamism and can also address wider challenges in society. It can reinforce the city's appeal to global 'talent' while maintaining the city's appeal to tourists and residents alike.

Greater London Authority: www.london.gov.uk
London & Partners: www.londonandpartners.com

Mumbai



Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai

Geographical area: 437.1 sq. km

Total population: 12,432,830

Percentage of total national population living in the city: 1%

Education level – percentage with degree level or higher: N/A

GDP per capita in 2008 (PPP): US\$10,800

Percentage creative industries employment: 16%

Mumbai's journey to becoming one of the world's great cities began under colonial rule. After more than a century under the Portuguese, the islands on which the city stood were transferred to the British in 1668, and then leased to the British East India Company, who moved their headquarters there some 20 years later. The city's status as a commercial hub was thus established early, and underpinned its subsequent development. Its port became one of the most important in the region, and traders from across the sub-continent were drawn to live and work there. The city continued to expand after Indian independence and is the largest in the country. It was renamed Mumbai in 1996.

While Mumbai's foreign-born population remains relatively small by the standards of other world cities, it is nevertheless a very diverse city, having drawn people of many ethnicities and religions from all over India. This diversity and resultant mixing of ideas is

credited with being the spark for Bollywood – the Hindi film industry which is centred on Mumbai, and is one of the largest in the world. Mumbai is also the leading centre of the Marathi film industry. Bollywood grew out of an idiosyncratic mix of factors in Mumbai – the presence of Parsi entrepreneurs, the legacy of Parsi theatre, the availability of capital in the city, and its multicultural ethos, among other things. Bollywood has played an important role in establishing a cultural identity for India, as well as building links between India and its various diasporas. It also has strong links with other creative industries, and helps explain Mumbai's position as the home of the headquarters of most of India's major television and satellite networks, as well as its major publishing houses.

Bollywood shows what is possible in Mumbai. In the beginning it was almost a cottage industry, unable to effectively reap economies of scale and was dogged by rumours of links with organised crime. Since the late 1990s, however, the situation has changed due to the growth in the overseas market for Bollywood films and the opening-up of India's economy. Considerable investment has begun to flow from Mumbai's telecom, software and media industries into Bollywood. This is reflected in the returns seen by the industry – the revenue from Bollywood films has grown by 360 per cent from 1985 to 2005.

The city also has other cultural strengths. Design, embroidery, and the gems and jewellery sector are all strong, and there is a huge (if low-profile) industry drawing on traditional craft skills. However, there are also weaknesses in the city's arts and entertainment offer. There is a low level of interest in the city's



museums; the potential of heritage buildings is being underplayed, and the performing arts are relatively neglected. Entertainment could also be strengthened: there is no Bollywood museum, for instance, and the city's traditional religious festivals could be marketed better. Indeed, Mumbai's share of India's tourism is declining – the city is increasingly seen as a gateway to the country rather than as a destination in its own right.

Despite the success of Bollywood, and Mumbai having many of the 'ingredients' of a world city, the city has struggled so far to achieve a comparable cultural impact (outside the film industry). Partly this is due to the low profile of the creative and cultural sector in the city – many of the statistics collected for this report, for instance, had to be gathered through primary research – but it also reflects the low priority government has attached to the creative and cultural sector in Mumbai.

With its large, young, dynamic and multicultural population in one of the world's fastest-growing economies, Mumbai ought to be well-placed to build a strong creative and cultural sector to offer development and tourist opportunities for the city. Indeed, recent research has suggested the creative industries are already a major source of employment in the city. For this to happen, though, government needs to understand the sector and its potential better, and be more willing to provide it with strategic support.



New York

New York City

Geographical area: 1,214.40 sq. km
Total population: 8,175,133
Percentage of total national population living in the city: 2.6%
Education level – percentage with degree level or higher: 33.3%
GDP per capita in 2008 (PPP): US\$73,300
Percentage creative industries employment: 8%

New York has long tied its rising power and economic success to investments in arts and culture. In its early nineteenth century aspirations to rival Boston, and later the great cities of Europe, New York's cultural life has been seen as a symbol of the city's wider vitality. From Carnegie Hall to MoMA, public-private partnerships linking civic ambition and wealthy philanthropists have endowed the city with world-class non-profit cultural institutions. Allied to this, New York's hugely dynamic cultural scene finds expression in everything from Broadway theatre to hip hop. The city is also a giant commercial marketplace for art and creative industries, from art auctions to fashion, design and advertising.

This creative energy is not just found in Manhattan. The fluid association of creative activity with particular neighbourhoods has served to define and redefine parts of the city. From Greenwich Village in the 1950s and '60s to SoHo and TriBeCa in the 1970s and '80s to Williamsburg and Dumbo in the

2000s, New York's creativity shifts and re-forms from place to place. This process continues; the presence of artists is currently helping to revive Bushwick, Brooklyn; Long Island City, Queens; Mott Haven in the Bronx; and St. George, Staten Island.

This fluidity is partly driven by the city's enormous diversity. New York has been one of the primary gateways to America for immigrants for centuries, and it continues to have a huge foreign-born population – currently 37 per cent of the total – who bring their own cultures to add to the city's mix. Residents and visitors alike are offered everything from Chinese opera to Czech marionette theatre to Bomba dance classes.

Culture's role in economic development is a priority for the city. This includes both its direct employment effects and its indirect effects. New York believes that the presence of artists and cultural organisations attracts other businesses who are looking for creative workers; students who want to experience the unique opportunities New York offers; and tourists from around the world. The number of tourists has risen by 30 per cent in the last decade, with international tourists particularly attracted by the city's cultural offerings.

While New York's position is an enviable one, it faces challenges. At a time of global economic pressures, sustaining a sector whose benefits can be hard to quantify becomes increasingly difficult. So, how can the city maximise the value of its cultural strengths? What is perhaps most striking about the approach of local government to supporting culture is its clear understanding of the interconnectedness

opposite: Times Square at Night, New York

Photo: Jen Davis, Courtesy of NYC Department of Cultural Affairs



of different forms and scales of cultural activity, and its willingness to cross the boundaries between profit and non-profit organisations. The commentator John Howkins has called this idea a creative 'ecology', an ecosystem in which many of the elements are interdependent.

New York continues to make substantial investments in upgrading its creative 'ecology'. It has recognised that a thriving culture is not built solely on a handful of world-class institutions. To that end, roughly half of the City of New York's cultural grants go to small organisations. Government also manages a robust portfolio of capital projects. From a new home for jazz at Lincoln Center, to major expansions of the Museum of Chinese in the Americas and the Brooklyn Children's Museum, to energy-efficient greenhouses at the New York Botanical Garden, these projects often involve world-class architects and always leverage private funding. In addition, New York City encourages and supports high-profile public art projects like *The Gates*, by Christo and Jeanne Claude and *The New York City Waterfalls* by Olafur Eliasson. These are all seen as strategic investments, not only strengthening New York's cultural sector, but also burnishing the city's identity and improving its quality of life.

The non-profit cultural sector has responded well so far to the challenges and opportunities posed by technology. Initiatives like the Metropolitan Opera's pioneering use of HD video to live stream performances have increased audience interest and attendance, and many arts organisations are successfully using social media to market their programmes and increase access.

Government support for commercial creative activity takes a number of forms. NYC & Company, the city's tourist and visitor agency, has a number

of marketing schemes including both commercial and non-profit cultural offerings. At a neighbourhood level, entities such as the Downtown Brooklyn Partnership, and the Upper Manhattan Empowerment Zone, serving Harlem, help support the cultural resurgence in their communities. In the last decade, using a combination of tax incentives and marketing, the Mayor's Office of Media and Entertainment, has catalysed an exponential increase in local film and television production. Recent initiatives to attract technology companies build on and reinforce the city's pool of innovative talent.

New York, then, seems well-placed to sustain its present position. In a globalised world where pre-eminence in any field can no longer be taken for granted, New York's combination of economic power, openness to ideas and immigrants, spaces in which up-and-coming artists can establish a foothold, and world-class cultural assets will ensure it remains one of the world's most culturally exciting cities.

New York City Department of Cultural Affairs:
www.nyc.gov/culture
New York City – The Official Guide: <http://nycgo.com>



Paris

Ile-de-France

Geographical area: 12,012 sq.km

Total population: 11,797,021

Percentage of total national population living in the city: 18.8%

Education level – percentage with degree level or higher: 35.8%

GDP per capita in 2008 (PPP): US\$56,900

Percentage creative industries employment: 8.8%

Paris has survived sieges, plague, wars, revolution and occupation to become one of the world's great centres of cultural life. In literature, music, cinema and, perhaps most of all, visual art, the city's residents have made huge contributions to cultural innovation. As the data shows, Parisians are also great consumers of culture, supporting a wide range of venues. In its post-colonial phase, the city has also become strikingly diverse and multiracial, opening up further possibilities for innovation and mixing.

Paris is recognised throughout the world as a centre of creative excellence, famous for its 'art de vivre'. Its cafés, bars, art house cinemas, fringe theatre, second-hand bookstalls and beautiful streetscapes are a huge draw for tourists – the Louvre is the world's most visited museum, for instance. Creative industries constitute a strategic sector for the Paris region (providing nine per cent of total jobs) and make a big contribution to its international appeal. Since 2005, Ile-de-France's regional economic

strategy has identified the cultural and creative industries as a priority area for economic development (this report's Paris data refers to the administrative region of the Ile-de-France).

The French government is committed to activist policies in this area, through legislation and regulation related to the French 'cultural exception'. This system of subsidies aims to maintain a strong cultural offer and reduce inequalities in access to culture. Paris has a strong commitment to cultural diversity and the independent production and distribution of cultural goods (for example, French films account for 50 per cent of the 600 films released in cinemas across the country per year). However, parts of the creative sector, from bookshops to filmmakers, remain under pressure from changing business models, especially the rise of digital (though as the data shows, Paris starts from a very high baseline in most respects).

The reality of central Paris – its high rents, and protected architecture and heritage sites – make developing creative and cultural industries and activities there difficult, despite the tourist presence providing millions of potential customers. However, artists still want to be in touch with the city centre's energy and wealth. Many of the most interesting efforts to encourage creativity in the city are therefore taking place in peripheral districts of Paris.

Two examples help to illustrate this trend. Under the aegis of the Greater Paris of Culture project, the European City of Cinema will be set up in a disused power station in Saint-Denis, at the heart of the



creative cluster known as the 'Territoire de la création'. La Cité du Cinéma is the brainchild of French film director Luc Besson. Due to open in September 2012, it will provide a comprehensive support service for film production, giving an A-Z of film production on one site.

The second example is Le Centquatre (104). This building in the multicultural but poor 19th arrondissement used to house a state funeral parlour, but is now home to a mix of spaces and to a range of artists, who are given studios in the building for several months in return for allowing the public to see their works in progress. The aim is to engage the public with the processes of cultural production (and in some cases to allow them to contribute to those processes). It welcomes all areas of the arts: theatre, dance, music, cinema and video, as well as the culinary, digital, and urban arts, and hosts an incubator.

New 'fringe' art forms are another source of fresh energy. The region's cultural policy has tried to find ways to give such forms a more institutional status. La Gaîté Lyrique is a new cultural institution dedicated to all forms of digital and urban culture. Located in a 150 year-old building in the heart of Paris, the venue

combines heritage and architecture: it aims to create a building where the amenities constitute a 'toolbox' for artists who wish to make use of it. It emphasises contemporary 'Parisian art de vivre' through its design and cutting edge equipment, which include a resources centre, a café, programmes and artistic productions, and new technologies for the use of artists.

The future of Paris' creative life would seem to rely on finding an accommodation between the new and the old in such ways. While its heritage culture remains a big attraction for tourists, there is a danger of the city centre becoming an 'open-air museum'. Countering this by developing innovative platforms for new art forms and technologies, as well as encouraging cross-sector collaboration, makes the reality of the city's vibrant culture more visible, and represents a way for culture to move forward in the city.

Institut d'Aménagement et d'Urbanisme Ile-de-France, Creative Economy Studies: www.iau-idf.fr/nos-etudes/sous-theme/economie-creative.html
Mairie de Paris: www.paris.fr
Région Ile-de-France: www.iledefrance.fr

Metropolitan Paris has its own unique spirit, a 'French touch' which is increasingly recognised ... whether in design, fashion, music, cinema, animation, special effects or the visual arts.

Paris



Shanghai

Shanghai Municipal District

Geographical area: 6340.5 sq. km
Total population: 23,474,600
Percentage of total national population living in the city: 1.7%
Education level – percentage with degree level or higher: 42.9%
GDP per capita in 2008 (PPP): US\$15,300
Percentage creative industries employment: 7.4%

Shanghai has emerged from its turbulent twentieth century of war, occupation and revolution as mainland China's largest city and commercial capital. Its size, relative wealth and position as a major port have long made it one of the most cosmopolitan of Chinese cities. Once known as the 'Paris of the East', it was home to as many as 70,000 foreigners in the early 1930s, and tens of thousands of Jewish refugees passed through the city in the years that followed.

As China moves inexorably towards becoming the planet's largest economy, Shanghai is seeking to re-establish itself as a world city. The city has become arguably the most vibrant and cosmopolitan place in China during the country's modernisation phase. As part of the industrial and social transformation of China, Shanghai has adopted a Four Centers Strategy, which aims to develop the city as a centre of international excellence in finance, trade, shipping and general economics. Shanghai has also recognised

that raising the profile of culture will be a necessary step in achieving 'world city' status.

By Chinese standards, Shanghai is an open and diverse city, able to draw on both European and American influences. Nevertheless, the legacy of the past century means that Shanghai has much catching up to do if it is to compare with the likes of New York, Tokyo, and London. It also faces competition from other Chinese cities, notably Beijing and Hong Kong. Shanghai has therefore started on an ambitious programme of cultural development; what has been described as a 'post-Expo' phase of development.

The 2010 World Expo held in Shanghai was something of a watershed for the city – its equivalent of Beijing's Olympic Games. The post-Expo cultural strategy of Shanghai aims to make the city a cultural metropolis by 2020. The ambition, known as a '1122 initiative', is to establish the city as a centre for creative design, for international cultural exchange and international fashion, and as a hub of modern cultural industry and creative talent. It is hoped that by 2020, Shanghai will be a city with enhanced cultural 'soft' power and an increasing international influence.

The city is taking many practical steps to deliver this strategy. Firstly, it is developing a series of new public cultural facilities. These include the Palace of Chinese Arts, Shanghai Contemporary Arts Museum, Shanghai Expo Museum and Shanghai Children's Art Theatre. Secondly, a theatrical performing arts cluster is to be planned and constructed by restructuring the layout of People's Square and the Tibet Road area. Thirdly, it aims to promote and upgrade the cultural



facilities in western Hongqiao region, so as to build a dance performing arts cluster and the Hongqiao International Dance Center.

Shanghai is also planning a number of other initiatives. In particular, it plans to build up its festivals and events programme further. It also intends to establish policies on talent development, and is launching a number of major projects in partnership with Western commercial creative organisations, such as Shanghai Disneyland and Oriental DreamWorks.

There are also changes underway in the structure of cultural organisations. Former state-owned cultural enterprises are being transformed into a market-oriented corporate system. This in part reflects a belief that the convergence of creativity and technology is creating major new opportunities for the city's cultural and creative industries, where SMEs and micro enterprises are playing an increasingly important role.

This is perhaps indicative of a greater willingness to blur the boundaries between subsidised and commercial culture in Shanghai than in many of the other world cities. Culture and creativity's contribution to innovation-led growth is a priority; as the city says, 'culture not only reflects the soft power of a city, but also determines its creative vitality'. This notion has underpinned the development of more than 100 creative industries clusters in the city. These include 1933, a giant former abattoir and factory which mixes commercial creative industries with offices, high-end retail and food; and the M50 art cluster, based in a former textile mill and now home to more than 120 galleries and studios.

Shanghai, with its highly planned approach and emphasis on the social and economic contribution of culture to development, is thus taking a somewhat

different approach from that of Western world cities. This in part reflects its distinct political structures and perceptions of the role of culture: Shanghai says that culture 'is an important source of national cohesion'. In Western world cities, much of the creative energy comes from a young and diverse population and from 'fringe' art forms. Shanghai's population, by contrast, is ageing fast (driven by a very low birth rate) and does not score highly on some measures of diversity, such as the number of foreign students or the percentage of foreign-born people living in the city. Furthermore, while the city states that the 'participation of everyone and access to everyone' is a cultural goal, participation rates are relatively low at the moment. If Shanghai is to achieve its ambition of becoming a cultural powerhouse it will have to find ways to reconcile its planning-driven approach with the need to allow new forms of cultural activity the intellectual and physical space to develop and find their audience.

Shanghai Municipal Administration of Culture, Radio, Film & TV: <http://wgj.sh.gov.cn>

Shanghai Information Service Platform for Cultural and Creative Industries: <http://shcci.eastday.com>
Shanghai Theatre Academy: www.sta.edu.cn

Sydney



Metropolitan Region of Sydney

Geographical area: 12,144.50 sq. km

Total population: 4,575,532

Percentage of total national population living in the city: 20.5%

Education level – percentage with degree level or higher: 35%

GDP per capita in 2008 (PPP): US\$48,900

Percentage creative industries employment: 5.3%

Sydney's cultural life is a blend of the formal and iconic, represented by its major cultural institutions and the informal, sometimes gritty and challenging activities of its artists and creative communities. Its natural beauty and climate shape Sydney's thriving, distinctive and sometimes surprising cultural life.

Sydney began as a community of strangers with wildly varying backgrounds and skills, brought together through adverse circumstances. With a third of the city's community being foreign-born and many more second-generation migrants, contemporary life in Sydney reflects this diversity of experiences and cultures. While most evident in its multiculturalism, this can be seen in other areas of the city's life as well, including its role as a gay and lesbian capital.

Much of the vitality of Sydney's cultural life is shaped by its climate and often spectacular natural setting. Focused on the Sydney Harbour Bridge, Sydney New Year's Eve is the largest and most globally recognisable New Year celebration in the world, while

many of Sydney's most successful events, such as Sydney Festival, Tropfest, Sculpture by the Sea, Sydney Gay and Lesbian Mardi Gras and Biennale of Sydney are held wholly or partly outdoors, taking full advantage of these idyllic conditions.

Chinese New Year in Sydney is the largest in the world outside of East and South East Asia, and, along with Parramasala, Sydney's celebration of South Asian arts and culture, demonstrates Sydney's diverse community and role as a cultural driver within the Asia-Pacific region. As well as major events and infrastructure, the 'everyday' cultural experience of the city includes permanent and temporary public art works, unexpected events and a subtle balance of fine grain activities, reflecting a layering of cultural texture in the daily life of Sydney.

Australian author David Malouf notes that when we think of other places what comes first to our mind as characterising their contribution to the world – their identity or style – is the arts they have produced: books, paintings, films, their orchestras and opera companies, their galleries, their music. A rich and vital cultural life for any city requires an ecosystem of artists, community and cultural organisations working at different scales – from the small scale fringe to artists performing or showing internationally. Sydney's diverse cultural ecosystem is another area in which it reinforces its idiosyncratic character and identity as a city of many cultural forms.

The Sydney Opera House, the Sydney Theatre Company, the Sydney Symphony Orchestra, Belvoir, and the Bangarra Dance Theatre together with many Sydney based artists, performers and writers are now



internationally celebrated. However, the culture of Sydney is also notable for the integral role that fringe and informal culture plays in it. This can be seen in its thriving live music scene, which includes both large venues and many smaller ones that focus on young or up-and-coming musicians. This fringe vibrancy is also evident in cultural forms such as cabaret, comedy, pop up events, short films, artist run initiatives and collectives, independent dance and theatre groups and the increasingly popular ideas and talks programmes, all of which have different entry points to participation and opportunities for the community to take part. Even the city's large scale and internationally recognised events are powered by the creative efforts of hundreds of artists and performers.

This accessibility is perhaps best seen in Sydney's significant independent performing, visual and interdisciplinary arts scenes. Often artist-run, this cultural activity is noticeably democratic and provides affordable performance or exhibition opportunities, as well as opportunities for involvement in other areas of cultural activity, such as marketing, writing, curating, lighting, sound design or set design. The strength of Sydney's arts participation is also found in the significant growth of artisan markets, demonstrating the city's renewed interest in handmade products. This trend, supported by digital delivery channels like Etsy and increased demand for semi-professional arts training, points to this growth in 'active' cultural participation by non-professional or semi-professional creative producers and shows that new relationships are being forged between artists and their audience unmediated by third parties.

Sydney recently became the home of the Federal Government's Creative Industries Innovation Centre, in recognition of the contribution of the creative industries to Australia's GDP (a comparable share

to that of the United States, Canada and France). Sydney is home to the largest population of creative workers in Australia, and a number of vibrant creative precincts and clusters have emerged in recent years. Supporting this sector within the workforce will be a focus of government authorities in the coming years, as the importance of the creative industries grows and integrates with more traditional business structures and networks.

In the coming years the cultural landscape of Sydney will change again. Significant large-scale urban development sites in and around the city including Barangaroo, Darling Harbour, Walsh Bay, Green Square and the Blue Mountains will see the development of a number of world-class arts and cultural facilities, giving rise to opportunities for the city to embed cultural infrastructure and activity into its design.

Increasing recognition and celebration of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander heritage and contemporary culture is planned, while physical and metaphorical connections between once isolated cultural institutions, such as the Sydney Opera House, the Powerhouse Museum, the Museum of Contemporary Art, the Maritime Museum, the Sydney Theatre, Sydney Observatory, and the Art Gallery of NSW will be made.

Although there is much to be found in Sydney's cultural ecology, a number of factors that have contributed to its cultural lifestyle – the city's natural beauty, relaxed lifestyle and Australia's buoyant economy – also affect the availability of space for up-and-coming artists and cultural producers to rehearse, perform, live or work. The challenges of affordability of space; financial sustainability and growing organisational capacity will be key to the city in coming years.

City of Sydney: www.cityofsydney.nsw.gov.au
Arts New South Wales: www.arts.nsw.gov.au



Tokyo

Tokyo Metropolis (Tokyo prefecture)

Geographical area: 2,130 sq. km

Total population: 13,159,388

Percentage of total national population living in the city: 10.3%

Education level – percentage with degree level or higher: 25.5%

GDP per capita in 2008 (PPP): US\$41,300

Percentage creative industries employment: 11.2%

While Tokyo has been Japan's most important city for almost 500 years, its rise to world city status was driven by its remarkable recovery from the ashes of the Second World War. Japanese companies and their famously hard-working staff were responsible for an 'economic miracle' that by the end of the 1980s had turned Japan into one of the world's richest nations. This rise had its echoes in culture, too. Elements of Japanese popular culture, from karaoke to manga comics and sushi bars spread across the globe, while creative products like the Sony Walkman shaped the way the world experienced culture. Japanese artists, whether they were filmmakers like Yasujiro Ozu and Akira Kurosawa or fashion designers like Issey Miyake and Rei Kawakubo, achieved worldwide reputations for the originality and quality of their work. Yet Tokyo remains different from other world cities. It has never been a draw for tourists on the scale of Paris or New York, and it has never had the levels of ethnic diversity or the number of foreign students of a London or

Sydney. However, Tokyo has developed a distinctive diversity of its own that takes unexpectedly various forms. Because of its depth, Tokyo's culture can be hard for tourists and even for the city's residents to fully grasp.

The long period of economic stagnation since the early 1990s has led to a relative decline in Tokyo's world city status, while the rise of other major cities in its region, such as Shanghai and Seoul, is increasing competition. The tragedy of the Great East Japan Earthquake in 2011 has also been a trigger for re-assessing society's priorities. There is now a growing sense that culture will play an important part in Tokyo's reinvention of itself in response to these challenges; what some commentators have called a 'new paradigm'.

What, then, are Tokyo's particular strengths? One answer lies in the multiple meanings of the Japanese word *bunka* (culture): artistic production, but also 'lifestyle', 'quality of life', and 'wellbeing'. Tokyo people do not see culture as separate or 'not for them': as the city puts it, 'common citizens have historically been very involved in a rich variety of artistic and cultural activities'. The culture of Tokyo is marked by 'reciprocal communication and an exceptional level of equality in cultural participation'. There has long been a blurring of the boundaries between consumers and creators, and between what Westerners sometimes call 'high' and 'pop' culture. In this way, what distinguishes Tokyo culture is the active role that ordinary citizens play as independent actors in cultural activities. There is a cultural element in the lives of many citizens, which forms a rich foundation for Tokyo's wider culture.



A second great strength of the city is its seamless continuity of tradition and modernity. In Tokyo, the traditional and the modern are linked not only spatially but temporally as well. Many foreigners see the city as an ultra-modern city of skyscrapers, cutting-edge fashion and design and high-technology. Yet the city remains the most important centre for traditional Japanese culture, having preserved its many traditional cultural forms, from ancient shrines and temples to Noh and Kabuki theatres and rakugo performances. Tokyo has several major venues for such art, including the Kabuki-za Theatre, the National Noh Theatre and the Kokugikan Hall in Ryogoku. It is also home to more traditional artisans than any other Japanese city. This concentration of traditional culture is a source of techniques, values, and inspiration for contemporary cultural workers in fields like design and architecture.

The more obviously modern aspects of Tokyo's culture can be seen in the city's various districts. Areas like Roppongi, Akihabara, Harajuku and Shibuya each have their own distinct culture – the city is keen to cultivate these. Although Tokyo is not a 'multicultural' city in the Western sense, it is open to ideas and culture from abroad, adapting them for its own purposes. This is apparent in Tokyo's cuisine which has absorbed and adapted foreign influences on its way to becoming (according to Michelin) the world's best city for high-class restaurants.

Tokyo recognises the need to improve its cultural offer through a programme of strategic investment. It believes it is essential to cultivate its human resources through supporting cultural facilities and programmes. The Tokyo Council for the Arts has been sustaining a mid- to long-term cultural policy to provide improved funding and support for the arts, and so to provide a platform for introducing and cultivating new talent.

For this reason, Tokyo is keen to upgrade its existing cultural facilities, as well as developing newer ones, such as the Tokyo Wonder Site, to create centres for new art (and artists). The city is also supporting new festivals and projects, which provide a stage for the cultivation of human resources by expanding opportunities for artists and arts administrators to enrich their experiences. In 2008, the city launched the Tokyo Culture Creation Project, which includes FESTIVAL/TOKYO, Roppongi Art Night, and Yebisu International Festival for Art & Alternative Visions. One of the most notable programmes is the Tokyo ArtPoint Project, which serves as a unique mechanism for forming regional cultural centres and promoting civic participation in creative endeavours.

Tokyo hopes to be able to demonstrate the fruits of this investment, and the new thinking that underpins it, to the world in 2020, as it is preparing a bid for that year's Olympic and Paralympic Games. If this is successful, it will generate numerous opportunities for the city to forge new ties between people and to facilitate creative production, while absorbing a diverse set of values from around the world. It will also demonstrate the ways in which the city's distinctive cultures express themselves. The Olympic and Paralympic Games thus have the potential to further stimulate Tokyo's culture of impartiality, interactivity, and tolerance, giving rise to an even deeper, more vibrant, dynamic, and diverse culture.

Tokyo Metropolitan Government:
www.metro.tokyo.jp/ENGLISH/index.htm
Tokyo Metropolitan Foundation for History and Culture: www.rekibun.or.jp/english/index.html
Tokyo Culture Creation Project:
www.bh-project.jp/index_e.html

Appendix 1: Choice of world cities

The *World Cities Culture Report 2012* builds on the work of an earlier research report, *London: A Cultural Audit* (2008). That report surveyed five cities: London, New York, Paris, Shanghai and Tokyo. The *World Cities Culture Report 2012* adds seven other cities to this list.

The world (or global) cities concept described by the likes of Saskia Sassen or the Globalisation and World Cities group at Loughborough University has tended to focus on the role of cities in the world's economic and financial system. Following that logic, a set of objective criteria such as economic wealth and population figures was used to determine the 'global importance' of a particular city (and hence to justify its inclusion in this cultural benchmarking research) as a way of narrowing down the potential candidates.

An initial selection framework divided the world into geographic regions. For each region the largest economy (GDP by purchasing power parity) was identified, before selecting that economy's largest city. This gives the list shown in Figure 8.

Figure 8. Choice of world cities

Geographic region	Largest economy (GDP by PPP)	Largest city
Europe	Germany	Berlin
West Asia	Turkey	Istanbul
South Asia	India	Mumbai ²
East Asia	China	Shanghai
North America	United States	New York
Latin America and Caribbean	Brazil	São Paulo
Africa	South Africa	Johannesburg
Oceania	Australia	Sydney

Source: BOP Consulting (2012)

2. Mumbai and Delhi have similar populations by many measures. According to the Indian Census 2011, Mumbai is the largest municipality and Greater Mumbai is the largest urban agglomeration in the country, but Delhi has a larger population when the wider metropolitan area is considered.

This initial selection process identified key world cities, in terms of global economic importance. These cities were combined with the original list of five, all of which are major economic players and the largest in their country too.

The twelfth and final city was chosen through a similar process. While a number of other cities, such as Moscow, Toronto or Milan, were considered, all of which are the largest cities of powerful economies, the authors decided to choose a South East Asian city as twelfth comparator. This region of the world did not have a representative among the 11, but is a rising force in the world economy. Strictly speaking, the above criteria would have led to Jakarta, the largest city in the region's biggest economy, Indonesia. However, the city-state of Singapore was chosen instead. This decision was based on a combination of factors: the city-state's relative economic importance (although it has only five million people, compared with Indonesia's 240 million, its GDP is around 30 per cent of Indonesia's) and its importance as a leader of global cultural agendas. Singapore is, for example, the key regional tourism and transport hub.

Appendix 2: Data tables

World cities cultural infrastructure and output

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
National museums				
Berlin	18	2010	Staatliche Museen zu Berlin – Preußischer Kulturbesitz	
Istanbul	7	2010	Ministry of Culture and Tourism	
Johannesburg	9	2012	VANSA	
London	11	2010	DCMS	
Mumbai	4	2012	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
New York	5	2012	Alliance for the Arts/NYC-ARTS	
Paris	24	2012	RMN (Réunion des musées nationaux)	
São Paulo	1	2012	IBRAM	Museu Lasar Segall
Shanghai	27	2010	Statistical Yearbook of Shanghai Cultural Relics 2010 (SYSCR2010)	
Singapore	5	2010	Singapore Cultural Statistics – Arts and Cultural Scene	
Sydney	1	2010	Museums & Galleries NSW Directory/Online Research	National Maritime Museum
Tokyo	8	2012	Japan Independent Administrative Institution	National Museum of Art
Other museums				
Berlin	140	2010	Staatliche Museen zu Berlin – Preußischer Kulturbesitz	
Istanbul	71	2010	Ministry of Culture and Tourism, Istanbul Visual Arts Report	
Johannesburg	51	2012	COJ 2030 Report/VANSA	
London	162	2005	MLA London (2007) Facts and Figures/Association of Independent Museums	
Mumbai	6	2012	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
New York	126	2012	Alliance for the Arts/NYC-ARTS/New York State Department of Education	
Paris	113	2009	Ministère de la Culture et de la communication (DEPS)	
São Paulo	110	2012	SPTuris	
Shanghai	87	2010	Shanghai Statistical Yearbook 2011	
Singapore	48	2010	Singapore Cultural Statistics – Arts and Cultural Scene	
Sydney	59	2010	Museums & Galleries NSW Directory/Online Research	
Tokyo	39	2011	Tokyo Metropolitan Government, Bureau of Citizens and Cultural Affairs / NLI Research Institute	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
Public libraries				
Berlin	88	2010	Amt für Statistik Berlin-Brandenburg	
Istanbul	42	2010	Turkish Statistical Institute	
Johannesburg	234	2010	Gauteng Library/Information Services 2010 Annual Report	
London	383	2010	CIPFA Stats Public Library Statistics	
Mumbai	80	2012	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
New York	220	2009	Institute of Museum and Library Services	
Paris	830	2011	Le Motif	
São Paulo	116	2012	SEMPRA	
Shanghai	477	2012	Shanghai Municipal Culture, Radio Broadcasting, Film and Television Administration (SMCBFTA)	
Singapore	25	2012	Public Libraries Singapore Website	
Sydney	154	2010	State Library New South Wales, Public Libraries in New South Wales Directory 2010	
Tokyo	377	2009	Tokyo Metropolitan Government, Bureau of General Affairs, Statistics Division	
No. of public libraries per 100,000 population				
Berlin	2.5	2010	Amt für Statistik Berlin-Brandenburg	
Istanbul	0.3	2010	Turkish Statistical Institute	
Johannesburg	2	2010	Gauteng Library/Information Services 2010 Annual Report	
London	5	2010	CIPFA Stats Public Library Statistics	
Mumbai	0.006	2012	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
New York	3	2009	Institute of Museum and Library Services	
Paris	7	2011	Le Motif/Insee	
São Paulo	1	2012	SEMPRA	
Shanghai	2	2012	Shanghai Municipal Culture, Radio Broadcasting, Film and Television Administration (SMCBFTA)	
Singapore	0.5	2012	Public Libraries Singapore Website	
Sydney	3	2010	State Library New South Wales, Public Libraries in New South Wales Directory 2010	
Tokyo	3	2009	Tokyo Metropolitan Government, Bureau of General Affairs, Statistics Division	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
No. of book loans by public libraries per year (million)				
Berlin	23.58	2010	Amt für Statistik Berlin-Brandenburg	
Istanbul	0.12	2010	Turkish Statistical Institute – Cultural Statistics	
Johannesburg	9.01	2010	Gauteng Library/Information Services 2010 Annual Report	
London	37.2	2010	CIPFA Stats Public Library Statistics	
Mumbai	2.05	2011	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
New York	68.04	2010	Bibliostat Connect	
Paris	47	2011	Le Motif (observatoire du livre et de l'écrit en Ile-de-France)	
São Paulo	0.84	2012	SEMLA	
Shanghai	58.69	2010	Shanghai Statistical Yearbook 2011(SSY2011)/STA	
Singapore	33.2	2010	National Library Board – Singapore Cultural Statistics 2011	
Sydney	20.83	2010	National and State Libraries Australasia	
Tokyo	112.24	2009	Tokyo Metropolitan Government, Bureau of General Affairs, Statistics Division, Management and Coordination Section	
No. of book loans by public libraries per capita per year				
Berlin	6.81	2010	Amt für Statistik Berlin-Brandenburg	
Istanbul	0.0085	2010	Turkish Statistical Institute – Cultural Statistics	
Johannesburg	0.8	2010	Gauteng Library and Information Services 2010 Annual Report	
London	4.8	2009	CIPFA Public Library Statistics 2009–10	Figure estimated from national figure
Mumbai	0.16	2011	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
New York	8.32	2010	Bibliostat Connect	
Paris	3.95	2011	Le Motif/Insee	
São Paulo	0.07	2011	SEMLA	
Shanghai	2.5	2010	SSY2011/STA	
Singapore	6.5	2010	National Library Board – Singapore Cultural Statistics 2011	
Sydney	4.55	2010	National and State Libraries Australasia	
Tokyo	8.64	2009	Tokyo Metropolitan Government, Bureau of General Affairs, Statistics Division, Management and Coordination Section	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
UNESCO World Heritage Sites				
Berlin	3	2012	UNESCO	
Istanbul	1	2012	UNESCO	
Johannesburg	1	2012	UNESCO	
London	4	2012	UNESCO	
Mumbai	2	2012	UNESCO	
New York	1	2012	UNESCO	
Paris	4	2012	UNESCO	
São Paulo	0	2012	UNESCO	
Shanghai	0	2012	UNESCO	
Singapore	0	2012	UNESCO	
Sydney	2	2012	UNESCO	
Tokyo	1	2012	UNESCO	
No. of other heritage/historical sites				
Berlin	8,689	2011	Landesdenkmalamt Denkmalliste Berlin	
Istanbul	30,188	2010	Turkish Statistical Institute – Cultural Statistics	
Johannesburg	281	2011	Provincial Heritage Resources Agency Gauteng	
London	18,901	2011	English Heritage – Heritage Counts 2011 London Report	
Mumbai	42	2012	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
New York	1,482	2012	The NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission	
Paris	3,792	2009	Ministère de la Culture et de la communication (DEPS)	
São Paulo	12	2012	Secretaria Municipal de Cultura	
Shanghai	2,049	2010	Shanghai Yearbook 2011	
Singapore	63	2010	Preservation of Monuments Board – Singapore Cultural Statistics 2011	
Sydney	783	2012	Australian Heritage Database	
Tokyo	419	2012	Agency for Cultural Affairs / NLI Research Institute	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
% of public green space (parks and gardens)				
Berlin	14.4%	2011	berlin.de	
Istanbul	1.5%	2009	Urban Age	
Johannesburg	24%	2002	State of the Environment Report, City of Johannesburg 2009	Figure does not refer to the Gauteng region but to the metropolitan area of Johannesburg
London	38.4%	2003	Urban Age	
Mumbai	2.5%	2011	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
New York	14%	2012	NYC Parks & Recreation	
Paris	9.4%	2009	IAU Ile-de-France	
Shanghai	2.6%	2012	SMCBFTA	
Singapore	47%	2011	National Parks Board	
Sydney	46%	2010	New South Wales Department of Planning	
Tokyo	3.4%	2011	'Survey of Parks', Bureau of Construction, Tokyo Metropolitan Government	
Theatres				
Berlin	56	2010	Deutscher Bühnenverein Theaterstatistik 2009/2010	
Istanbul	184	2010	Ministry of Culture and Tourism, Istanbul Performing Arts Report	
Johannesburg	24	2012	COJ 2030 report/VANSA	
London	214	2010	Arts Council England & Visit London	
Mumbai	120	2012	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
New York	420	2012	Alliance for the Arts/NYC-ARTS	
Paris	353	2011	CNT	
São Paulo	116	2012	SPTuris	
Shanghai	97	2010	SYSCR2010	
Singapore	55	2012	Street Directory Singapore/AlloExpat Singapore	
Sydney	73	2012	Live Performance Australia/Yellow Pages	
Tokyo	230	2012	Directory of Theatre Guide/NLI Research	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
No. of theatrical performances at all theatres per year				
Berlin	6,900	2010	Deutscher Bühnenverein Theaterstatistik 2009/2010	
Istanbul	6,349	2010	Ministry of Culture and Tourism, Istanbul Performing Arts Report	
Johannesburg	5,000	2011	VANSA	
London	32,448	2012	Time Out London	Scaled up from weekly figures
Mumbai	8,750	2012	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
New York	43,004	2012	Time Out New York	Scaled up from weekly figures
Paris	26,676	2011	Officiel des Spectacles	Scaled up from weekly figures
Shanghai	15,618	2010	SYSCR2010/Shanghai Culture Yearbook 2011 (SCY2011)	
Singapore	2,421	2010	National Arts Council – Singapore Cultural Statistics 2011	
Sydney	4,966	2012	Time Out Sydney	Scaled up from weekly figures
Tokyo	24,575	2008	Pia Research Institute/NLI Research Institute	Figure estimated from national figure
No. of live music venues				
Berlin	250	2012	berlin.de	
Istanbul	91	2010	Ministry of Culture and Tourism, Istanbul Music Industry Report	
Johannesburg	46	2012	South African Music Rights Organisation/VANSA	
London	349	2011	Time Out London/The Unsigned Band Guide 2011/ViewLondon	
Mumbai	98	2012	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
New York	277	2012	Alliance for the Arts/NYC-ARTS	
Paris	423	2012	Pages Jaunes	
São Paulo	294	2011	SPTuris	
Shanghai	44	2012	STA	
Sydney	69	2012	about.nsw.org, Directory of Live Music Venues NSW/BOP	
Tokyo	385	2012	Let's Enjoy Tokyo Directory	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
Major concert halls				
Berlin	2	2012	Statistisches Bundesamt Deutschland	
Istanbul	6	2010	Ministry of Culture and Tourism, Istanbul Music Industry Report	
Johannesburg	4	2012	VANSA	
London	10	2011	Visit London/BOP	
Mumbai	2	2012	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
New York	15	2012	BOP	
Paris	15	2012	Médiathèque Cité de la musique/IAU Ile-de-France	
São Paulo	7	2012	SPTuris	
Shanghai	4	2012	STA	
Singapore	8	2012	BOP	
Sydney	4	2012	BOP	
Tokyo	15	2011	NLI Research Institute	
No. of music performances per year				
Johannesburg	7,400	2012	VANSA	
London	17,108	2012	Time Out London	Scaled up from weekly figures
Mumbai	593	2012	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
New York	22,204	2012	Time Out New York	Scaled up from weekly figures
Paris	33,020	2012	Lylo	
Shanghai	3,356	2008	Ministry of Culture	
Singapore	2,418	2010	National Arts Council – Singapore Cultural Statistics 2011	
Sydney	1,014	2012	Time Out Sydney	Scaled up from weekly figures
Tokyo	15,617	2008	2009 Pia Research Institute	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
No. of comedy clubs				
Berlin	15	2012	Qype Germany	
Istanbul	1	2011	istanbul.net.tr	
Johannesburg	1	2011	VANSA	
London	18	2012	Time Out London	
Mumbai	1	2012	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
New York	48	2012	BOP	
Paris	45	2012	Officiel des spectacles	
São Paulo	1	2012	Guia da Folha	
Singapore	1	2012	BOP	
Sydney	3	2012	BOP	
No. of comedy shows/performances per year				
Johannesburg	508	2011	VANSA	
London	11,388	2012	Time Out London	Scaled up from weekly figures
Mumbai	217	2012	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
New York	11,076	2012	Time Out New York	Scaled up from weekly figures
Paris	10,348	2012	Officiel des spectacles	Scaled up from weekly figures
São Paulo	300	2012	Guia da Folha	
Singapore	416	2012	Time Out Singapore	Scaled up from weekly figures
Sydney	432	2012	Time Out Sydney	Scaled up from weekly figures
Tokyo	8,452	2008	2009 Pia Research Institute/NLI Research Institute	Figure estimated from national figure

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
No. of dance performances per year				
Berlin	111	2010	Deutscher Bühnenverein Theaterstatistik 2009/2010	
Istanbul	154	2010	Turkish Statistical Institute – Cultural Statistics	
Johannesburg	250	2012	VANSA	Figure reflects contemporary dance performances only
London	2,756	2012	Time Out London	Scaled up from weekly figures
Mumbai	130	2012	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
New York	6,292	2012	Time Out New York	Scaled up from weekly figures
Paris	3,172	2012	Officiel des spectacles	Scaled up from weekly figures
São Paulo	100	2012	Guia da Folha	
Shanghai	1,686	2008	Ministry of Culture	
Singapore	1,572	2010	National Arts Council – Singapore Cultural Statistics 2011	
Sydney	283	2012	Time Out/Ticketmaster/Sydney Opera House	Estimate/Scaled up from weekly figures
Tokyo	1,598	2008	2009 Pia Research Institute/NLI Research Institute	Figure estimated from national figure
Art galleries				
Berlin	421	2012	Landesverband für Berliner Gallerien	
Istanbul	267	2010	Ministry of Culture and Tourism	
Johannesburg	76	2012	VANSA	
London	857	2012	BOP	
Mumbai	152	2012	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
New York	721	2012	Alliance for the Arts/NYC-ARTS & Art Dealers Association of America/Art-Collecting.com	
Paris	1,046	2012	Tram/Pages jaunes	
Shanghai	208	2010	SMCBFTA/OSCS2011/STA	
Singapore	252	2012	BOP	
Sydney	122	2012	Museums & Galleries NSW Directory/BOP	
Tokyo	688	2011	Tokyo Metropolitan Government. Bureau of Citizens and Cultural Affairs/2011 Bijutsu-Nenkansha/NLI Research Institute	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
Specialist public cultural HE establishments				
Berlin	5	2012	Das Bildungs-und Studenten-Portal	
London	11	2010	HESA (2011)	
Mumbai	18	2012	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
Paris	30	2010	Ministère de la Culture et de la communication (DEPS)	
São Paulo	2	2012	UNESP – Instituto de Artes e Música and USP – Escola de Comunicação e Artes	
Shanghai	5	2010	Shanghai Education Statistics Manual 2011	
Sydney	2	2012	universitiesaustralia.edu	
Tokyo	1	2012	NLI Research Institute	
Specialist private cultural HE establishment				
Berlin	12	2012	berlin.de/movie-college.de	
Johannesburg	24	2012	VANSA	
London	46	2012	BOP	
New York	12	2011	Center for an Urban Future	
Paris	73	2011	L'Etudiant/IAU Ile-de-France (Visiaurif)	
São Paulo	4	2012	Prefeitura de São Paulo	
Shanghai	18	2011	Shanghai Municipal Education Commission	
Singapore	2	2012	Ministry of Education – Education Statistics Digest 2011	
Sydney	20	2012	universitiesaustralia.edu	
Tokyo	16	2012	NLI Research Institute	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
No. of students of specialist Art & Design public institutions				
Berlin	5,091	2009	Das Bildungs-und Studenten-Portal	
London	34,920	2010	HESA (2011)	
Mumbai	1,375	2011	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
Paris	14,024	2010	Ministère de la culture et de la communication / Manufacture nationale de Sèvres / CCIP	
Shanghai	13,324	2010	SESM2011	
Sydney	15,571	2010	National institute of dramatic arts/National Art School	
Tokyo	24,120	2011	Tokyo Metropolitan Government, Bureau of Citizens and Cultural Affairs / NLI Research Institute	
No. of students of Art & Design degree courses at generalist universities				
Istanbul	774	2010	Ministry of Culture and Tourism, Istanbul Visual Arts Report	
Johannesburg	9,066	2010	Department of Higher Education	
London	15,745	2010	HESA (2011)	
Shanghai	43,501	2012	Shanghai Municipal Education Commission	
Singapore	7,660	2010	National Arts Council – Singapore Cultural Statistics 2011	
Sydney	13,972	2010	Australian Government Department of Education, 2010 Students Higher Education Statistics	
Tokyo	25,444	2011	Tokyo Metropolitan Government, Bureau of Citizens and Cultural Affairs / NLI Research Institute	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
No. of non-professional dance schools				
Berlin	104	2012	Gelbe Seiten	
Istanbul	98	2012	Yellow Pages	
Johannesburg	36	2012	VANSA	
London	618	2012	Yell	
New York	682	2012	NYC Performing Arts Spaces	
Paris	715	2012	Pages jaunes	
São Paulo	29	2012	Guia São Paulo	
Shanghai	438	2012	Dianping.com	
Singapore	89	2012	Eguide Singapore Business Directory	
Sydney	441	2012	Yellow Pages	
Tokyo	748	2012	Nippon Telegraph and Telephone Corporation / NLI Research Institute	
Cinemas				
Berlin	94	2011	Filmförderungsanstalt	
Istanbul	118	2010	Ministry of Culture and Tourism, Istanbul Film Industry Report	
Johannesburg	47	2012	NFVF/VANSA	
London	108	2010	BFI Statistical Yearbook 2011	
Mumbai	105	2012	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
New York	117	2012	cinematreasures.org/mrmovietimes.com	
Paris	302	2010	CNC	
São Paulo	45	2011	ECINE	
Shanghai	230	2012	SMCBFTA	
Singapore	34	2010	BOP	
Sydney	67	2011	Movie Fix	
Tokyo	82	2010	Industrial Statistics Office, Research and Statistics Department, Economic and Industrial Policy Bureau, Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
Cinema screens				
Berlin	266	2011	Filmförderungsanstalt	
Istanbul	501	2010	Ministry of Culture and Tourism, Istanbul Film Industry Report	
Johannesburg	368	2012	NFVF/VANSA	
London	566	2010	BFI Statistical Yearbook 2011	
Mumbai	232	2012	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
New York	501	2012	Cinematreasures.org/Mrmovietimes	
Paris	1003	2010	CNC	
São Paulo	282	2011	ECINE	
Shanghai	670	2010	Shanghai Yearbook 2011	
Singapore	239	2010	BOP	
Sydney	295	2012	Movie Fix/Screen Australia	Figure estimated from regional figure
Tokyo	334	2010	Industrial Statistics Office, Research and Statistics Department, Economic and Industrial Policy Bureau, Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry	
No. of cinema screens per million population				
Berlin	77	2011	Filmförderungsanstalt	
Istanbul	38	2010	Ministry of Culture and Tourism, Istanbul Film Industry Report	
Johannesburg	33	2012	NFVF/VANSA	
London	73	2010	BFI Statistical Yearbook 2011	
Mumbai	19	2012	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
New York	61	2012	cinematreasures.org/mrmovietimes.com	
Paris	85	2010	CNC	
São Paulo	25	2011	ECINE	
Shanghai	28	2010	Shanghai Yearbook 2011	
Singapore	47	2010	BOP	
Sydney	64	2012	Movie Fix/Screen Australia	Figure estimated from regional figure
Tokyo	25	2010	Industrial Statistics Office, Research and Statistics Department, Economic and Industrial Policy Bureau, Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
No. of films given theatrical release in the country in a year				
Berlin	508	2010	Spitzenorganisation der Filmwirtschaft Filmstatistisches Jarbuch 2011	
Istanbul	254	2009	Ministry of Culture and Tourism, Istanbul Film Industry Report	
Johannesburg	203	2011	NFVF	
London	557	2010	BFI Statistical Yearbook 2011	
Mumbai	3,781	2010	Central Board of Film Certification (CBFC), Mumbai, Annual Report 2010	
New York	610	2011	Motion Picture Association of America	
Paris	575	2010	CNC	
São Paulo	303	2010	ECINE	
Shanghai	252	2011	STA	
Singapore	352	2009	Screen Digest	
Sydney	342	2011	Screen Australia	
Tokyo	799	2011	Motion Picture Producers Association of Japan	
No. of foreign films given theatrical release in the country in a year				
Berlin	315	2010	Spitzenorganisation der Filmwirtschaft Filmstatistisches Jarbuch 2011	
Istanbul	184	2009	Ministry of Culture and Tourism, Istanbul Film Industry Report	
Johannesburg	21	2011	NFVF	
London	438	2010	BFI Statistical Yearbook 2011	
Mumbai	298	2010	Central Board of Film Certification (CBFC), Mumbai, Annual Report 2010	
Paris	305	2010	CNC	
São Paulo	228	2010	ECINE	
Shanghai	60	2011	Filmsh	
Sydney	306	2011	Screen Australia	
Tokyo	358	2011	Motion Picture Producers Association of Japan	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
Film festivals				
Berlin	33	2012	Berlin.de	
Istanbul	35	2010	Ministry of Culture and Tourism, Istanbul Music Industry Report	
Johannesburg	16	2012	NFVF/VANSA	
London	61	2011	British Council	
Mumbai	6	2011	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
New York	57	2012	NYC.gov	
Paris	190	2010	Drac Ile-de-France	
São Paulo	29	2011	ECINE	
Shanghai	2	2010	Shanghai Yearbook 2011	
Sydney	36	2012	Weekend Notes Sydney	
Tokyo	35	2012	Yamagata International Documentary Film Festival	
Bookshops				
Berlin	245	2012	Gelbe Seiten	
Istanbul	463	2012	Yellow Pages	
Johannesburg	1,020	2012	VANSA/SABDA	
London	802	2011	Booksellers Association	
Mumbai	525	2012	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
New York	777	2012	Citysearch	
Paris	1,025	2011	le Motif	
São Paulo	869	2011	ANL	
Shanghai	1,322	2010	SCY2011	
Singapore	164	2012	Eguide Singapore Business Directory	
Sydney	439	2012	Yellow Pages	
Tokyo	1,675	2009	Nippon Shuppan Hanbai Inc	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
Bookshops per 100.000 population				
Berlin	7	2012	Gelbe Seiten	
Istanbul	3	2012	Yellow Pages	
Johannesburg	9	2012	VANSA/SABDA	
London	10	2011	Booksellers Association	
Mumbai	4	2012	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
New York	9	2012	Citysearch	
Paris	9	2011	le Motif	
São Paulo	8	2011	ANL	
Shanghai	15	2010	SCY2011	
Singapore	3	2012	Eguide Singapore Business Directory	
Sydney	10	2012	Yellow Pages	
Tokyo	13	2009	Nippon Shuppan Hanbai Inc	
Rare and second-hand bookshops				
Berlin	4	2012	Gelbe Seiten	
Johannesburg	943	2012	VANSA/SABDA database	
London	68	2011	Experian	
Mumbai	6	2012	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
New York	99	2012	Citysearch	
Paris	282	2012	Pages jaunes	
São Paulo	90	2011	Guia Mais	
Shanghai	343	2012	kongfz.com	
Singapore	12	2012	Eguide Singapore Business Directory	
Sydney	93	2012	Yellow Pages	
Tokyo	681	2012	Japanese Association of Dealers in Old Books/ NLI Research Institute	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
No. of book titles published in the country in a year				
Berlin	93,124	2010	Borsenverein des Deutschen Buchhandels	
Istanbul	34,863	2010	Ministry of Culture and Tourism	
Johannesburg	3,653	2010	South African Publishers Association	
London	151,969	2010	The Booksellers Association/Nielsen Book	
Mumbai	82,537	2008	Federation of Indian Publishers	
New York	302,410	2009	Bowker	
Paris	74,788	2009	SNE	
São Paulo	57,600	2009	CBL	
Shanghai	328,387	2010	The General Administration of Press and Publication of the P. R. China	
Sydney	8,602	2005	Australian Bureau of Statistics	Figure for Australian Titles Only
Tokyo	78,501	2009	Japan Statistical Research and Training Institute, Ministry of Internal Affairs and Communications (MIAC)	
Night clubs, discos and dance halls				
Berlin	152	2012	Club Guide Berlin	
London	337	2011	Yell	
Mumbai	29	2012	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
New York	584	2012	Citysearch	
Paris	190	2012	Time out Paris	
São Paulo	2,000	2011	Isto É – Dinheiro	Estimate
Shanghai	1,865	2011	STA	
Singapore	56	2012	Eguide Singapore Business Directory	
Sydney	75	2012	Yellow Pages	
Tokyo	73	2012	Time Out Tokyo	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
No. of bars				
Berlin	1,247	2008	Amt für Statistik Berlin-Brandenburg	
Istanbul	657	2012	Yellow Pages	
London	2,143	2011	Yell	
Mumbai	543	2012	Yellow Pages	
New York	7,224	2012	New York State Liquor Authority	
Paris	3,350	2009	Synhorcat	
Shanghai	1,320	2012	s.baidu.com	
Singapore	576	2012	Eguide Singapore Business Directory Bars and Pubs	
Sydney	661	2011	NSW Government Licensing Service	
Tokyo	14,184	2012	Kakaku.com. Inc.	
Bars per 100,000 population				
Berlin	36	2008	Amt für Statistik Berlin-Brandenburg	
Istanbul	5	2012	Yellow Pages	
London	27	2011	Yell	
Mumbai	4	2012	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
New York	88	2012	New York State Liquor Authority	
Paris	30	2009	Synhorcat/Insee	
Shanghai	6	2012	STA	
Singapore	11	2012	Eguide Singapore Business Directory Bars and Pubs	
Sydney	14	2011	NSW Government Licensing Service	
Tokyo	108	2012	Kakaku.com. Inc.	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
No. of restaurants				
Berlin	4,885	2008	Amt für Statistik Berlin-Brandenburg	
Istanbul	1,508	2012	Yellow Pages	
Johannesburg	15,000	2012	FEDHASA/VANSA	Estimate
London	37,450	2011	Food Standards Agency	
Mumbai	13,205	2012	Brihanmumbai Municipal Corporation Diary	
New York	24,149	2012	New York City Department of Health Restaurant Inspection Information	
Paris	22,327	2010	Pôle emploi	
São Paulo	12,500	2011	SPTuris	
Shanghai	55,614	2012	Dianping.com	
Singapore	2,637	2010	Statistics Singapore	
Sydney	4,554	2011	NSW Government Licensing Service	
Tokyo	150,510	2009	Tokyo Metropolitan Government, Bureau of Social Welfare and Public Health	
No. of restaurants per 100,000 population				
Berlin	141	2008	Amt für Statistik Berlin-Brandenburg	
Istanbul	11	2012	Yellow Pages	
Johannesburg	133	2012	FEDHASA/VANSA	
London	478	2011	Food Standards Agency	
Mumbai	11	2012	Brihanmumbai Municipal Corporation Diary	
New York	295	2012	New York City Department of Health Restaurant Inspection Information	
Paris	189	2010	Pôle emploi	
São Paulo	111	2011	SPTuris	
Shanghai	237	2012	dianping.com	
Singapore	51	2010	Statistics Singapore	
Sydney	99	2012	NSW Government Licensing Service	
Tokyo	1144	2009	Tokyo Metropolitan Government, Bureau of Social Welfare and Public Health	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
No. of Michelin star restaurants				
Berlin	14	2012	Michelin Guide Website	
London	64	2012	Via Michelin	
New York	62	2012	Michelin Travel	
Paris	97	2012	Guide Michelin	
Tokyo	247	2012	Michelin Japan/NLI Research Institute	
No. of markets				
Johannesburg	37	2012	VANSA	
London	113	2008	The London Market Guide	
New York	100	2011	NYC Office of Citywide Event Coordination Management	
Paris	2,124	2010	Pôle emploi	
São Paulo	43	2011	Biblioteca Virtual	
Shanghai	262	2011	STA	
Sydney	30	2012	Local Market Guide Australia	
Festivals and celebrations				
Berlin	63	2012	Time Out Berlin	
Istanbul	136	2010	Ministry of Culture and Tourism, Istanbul Music Industry Report	
Johannesburg	82	2012	VANSA	
London	254	2011	Visit London	
Mumbai	34	2012	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
New York	309	2011	NYC Office of Citywide Event Coordination Management	
Paris	360	2011	Direction Régionale des Affaires Culturelles d'Ile-de-France	
Shanghai	33	2010	OSCS2011	
Sydney	312	2012	Weekend Notes Sydney	
Tokyo	485	2011	Tokyo Metro Co., Ltd. & Gurunavi, Inc.	

World cities cultural consumption and participation

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
No. of international students studying in the city				
Berlin	21,805	2010	Amt für Statistik Berlin-Brandenburg	
Istanbul	6,643	2011	OSYM ('Öğrenci Seçme Yerleştirme Merkezi'/'Student Selection and Placement Center')	
Johannesburg	37,067	2010	Department of Higher Education and Training	
London	99,360	2010	UKCISA (UK Council for International Students Affairs)	
Mumbai	1,500	2011	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
New York	60,791	2010	Institute of International Education	
Paris	96,782	2007	Ministère de l'éducation nationale, de l'enseignement supérieur et de la recherche	
São Paulo	15,432	2012	Prefeitura de São Paulo	
Shanghai	43,016	2010	Shanghai Yearbook 2011	
Singapore	91,500	2010	Immigration and Checkpoints Authority (ICA)	
Sydney	N/A	2008	City of Sydney, Needs Assessment of International Students in the City of Sydney Report	Figure is not available for Sydney but New South Wales has 180,000 international students, among which a large majority study in Sydney
Tokyo	43,188	2011	Japan Student Services Organisation	
No. of video games arcades				
Istanbul	18	2010	Yellow Pages	
Johannesburg	11	2012	VANSA	
London	44	2012	Yell	
Mumbai	278	2012	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
New York	17	2012	Citysearch	
Paris	14	2012	IAU Ile-de-France Estimate	
Shanghai	587	2010	OSCS2011	
Sydney	10	2012	Yellow Pages	
Tokyo	997	2010	National Police Agency	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
Museums/galleries attendance - % working age population attending once per year				
Johannesburg	8%	2011	VANSA	
London	54%	2010	DCMS Taking Part Survey 2011	
Paris	43%	2008	Ministère de la culture et de la communication	
Shanghai	47%	2010	SSY2011	Figure includes both adults and children
Singapore	40%	2009	Population Survey of the Arts	Figure corresponds to 'Percentage of Singaporeans who have attended at least one arts event in the past year'
Sydney	26%	2008	Australian Bureau of Statistics	
Tokyo	33%	2006	Japan Statistics Bureau, Ministry of Internal Affairs and Communications (MIAC) / NLI Research Institute	
No. of visits to top five most visited museums and galleries				
Berlin	4,718,729	2010	berlin.de	
Istanbul	7,131,480	2011	Istanbul Provincial Directorate of Culture and Tourism	
Johannesburg	676,208	2011	VANSA	
London	25,327,221	2011	DCMS	
Mumbai	1,800,895	2011	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
New York	15,417,115	2011	DCA/The Art Newspaper	
Paris	23,416,427	2010	CRT Paris-Ile-de-France	
São Paulo	2,175,305	2012	Prefeitura de São Paulo	
Shanghai	6,633,392	2011	STA	
Singapore	2,734,900	2011	Monthly Digest of Statistics Singapore	
Sydney	2,844,063	2011	The Art Newspaper Exhibitions & Museum Attendance Figures 2011/BOP Consulting	
Tokyo	9,732,107	2009	Tokyo Metropolitan Government, Bureau of General Affairs, Statistics Division, Management and Coordination Section / NLI Research Institute	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
No. of visits to top five museums and galleries per capita				
Berlin	1.36	2010	berlin.de	
Istanbul	0.52	2011	Istanbul Provincial Directorate of Culture and Tourism	
Johannesburg	0.05	2011	primary consultation with museums and galleries	
London	3.2	2011	DCMS	
Mumbai	0.14	2011	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
New York	1.89	2011	DCA/The Art Newspaper	
Paris	2.0	2009	CRT Paris-Ile-de-France / Insee	
São Paulo	0.19	2012	Prefeitura de São Paulo	
Shanghai	0.28	2011	STA	
Singapore	0.5	2011	Monthly Digest of Statistics Singapore	
Sydney	0.62	2011	The Art Newspaper, Exhibitions & Museum Attendance Figures 2011 / BOP Consulting	
Tokyo	0.75	2009	Tokyo Metropolitan Government, Bureau of General Affairs, Statistics Division, Management and Coordination Section / NLI Research Institute	
Average daily no. of visits to top five art exhibitions				
Berlin	1,653	2011	The Art Newspaper, Exhibitions & Museum Attendance Figures 2011	
Istanbul	2,179	2011	The Art Newspaper, Exhibitions & Museum Attendance Figures 2011	
London	4,011	2011	The Art Newspaper, Exhibitions & Museum Attendance Figures 2011	
New York	5,783	2011	The Art Newspaper, Exhibitions & Museum Attendance Figures 2011	
Paris	8,130	2010	CRT Paris-Ile-de-France/IAU Ile-de-France	
São Paulo	3,182	2011	The Art Newspaper, Exhibitions & Museum Attendance Figures 2011	
Shanghai	10,342	2010	STA	
Sydney	2,104	2011	The Art Newspaper, Exhibitions & Museum Attendance Figures 2011	
Tokyo	6,258	2010	Seikatsu no Tomo Co. / NLI Research Institute	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
No. of admissions at all theatres per year				
Berlin	2,378,818	2010	Kulturförderbericht 2011 des Landes Berlin	
Istanbul	2,358,146	2010	Turkish Statistical Institute – Cultural Statistics	
Johannesburg	1,700,000	2011	VANSA	
London	14,152,230	2010	SOLT	Figure only concerns members of The Society of London Theatre
Mumbai	2,673,563	2012	Mumbai Theatre Guide	
New York	28,187,344	2011	DCA/NYC & Co.	
Paris	5,700,000	2008	ASTP (Association pour le soutien au Théâtre privé) / IAU îdF	Figure only concerns private theatres
Shanghai	630,200	2010	OSCS2011	
Singapore	615,200	2010	National Arts Council – Singapore Cultural Statistics 2011	
Sydney	700,700	2008	Australian Bureau of Statistics	
Tokyo	12,011,000	2008	2009 Pia Research Institute	
No. of theatre admissions per capita per year				
Berlin	0.69	2010	Kulturförderbericht 2011 des Landes Berlin	
Istanbul	0.18	2010	Turkish Statistical Institute – Cultural Statistics	
Johannesburg	0.15	2011	VANSA	
London	1.8	2010	SOLT	Figure only concerns members of The Society of London Theatre
Mumbai	0.21	2012	Mumbai Theatre Guide	
New York	3.45	2011	DCA/NYC & Co.	
Paris	0.5	2008	ASTP/SACD/Ministère de la Culture et de la communication (DEPS)/Insee	Figure only concerns private theatres
Shanghai	0.27	2010	OSCS2011/STA	
Singapore	0.12	2010	National Arts Council – Singapore Cultural Statistics 2011	
Sydney	0.15	2008	Australian Bureau of Statistics	
Tokyo	0.93	2008	2009 Pia Research Institute	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
Total value of theatre ticket sales at all theatres per year – \$m (ppp)				
Berlin	\$47,683,000	2009	Deutscher Bühnenverein – Bundesverband der Theater und Orchester	
Johannesburg	\$13,722,800	2011	VANSA	Estimate
London	\$765,817,351	2010	SOLT	Figure only concerns members of The Society of London Theatre
Mumbai	\$41,214,166	2011	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	Figure estimated from average ticket price
New York	\$1,080,894,119	2011	The League of American Theatres and Producers	Figure only concerns Broadway productions
Paris	\$111,855,104	2009	ASTP/SACD/Ministère de la Culture et de la communication (DEPS)	Figure only concerns private theatres
Shanghai	\$32,000,000	2010	OSCS2011/STA	
Singapore	\$242,624	2009	Singapore Cultural Statistics 2011 – Economic Contribution of the Arts and Cultural Sector	
Sydney	\$22,050,197	2008	Australian Bureau of Statistics & Live Performance Australia	Figure estimated from average ticket price
Tokyo	\$777,637,196	2008	2009 Pia Research Institute / NLI Research Institute	
Total value of ticket sales at all theatres per capita per year – \$m (ppp)				
Berlin	\$13.78	2009	Deutscher Bühnenverein – Bundesverband der Theater und Orchester	
Johannesburg	\$1.21	2011	VANSA	Estimate
London	\$98	2010	SOLT	Figure only concerns West End productions
Mumbai	\$3.31	2011	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	Figure estimated from average ticket price
New York	\$132	2011	The League of American Theatres and Producers	Figure only concerns Broadway productions
Paris	\$34.58	2009	ASTP/SACD/Ministère de la Culture et de la communication (DEPS)	Figure only concerns private theatres
Shanghai	\$1.36	2010	OSCS2011/STA	
Singapore	\$0.05	2009	Singapore Cultural Statistics 2011 – Economic Contribution of the Arts and Cultural Sector	
Sydney	\$4.82	2008	Australian Bureau of Statistics & Live Performance Australia	Figure estimated from average ticket price
Tokyo	\$60.30	2008	2009 Pia Research Institute / NLI Research Institute	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
No. of cinema admissions per year				
Berlin	9,126,793	2011	Filmförderungsanstalt	
Istanbul	10,272,528	2009	Ministry of Culture and Tourism, Istanbul Film Industry Report	
Johannesburg	13,079,824	2007	National Film and Video Foundation	
London	41,571,000	2011	BFI Statistical Yearbook 2011	
Mumbai	10,974,667	2011	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
Paris	58,246,000	2010	CNC	
São Paulo	50,000,000	2011	Organização Filme B	
Shanghai	22,878,000	2010	SCY2011	
Singapore	22,117,400	2011	Monthly Digest of Statistics Singapore	
Sydney	22,044,910	2010	Screen Australia/BOP Consulting	Figure estimated from Sydney cinema attendance rate and Sydney cinema attendance frequency
Tokyo	29,255,665	2010	Industrial Statistics Office, Research and Statistics Department, Economic and Industrial Policy Bureau, Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry	
No. of cinema admissions per capita per year				
Berlin	2.6	2011	Filmförderungsanstalt	
Istanbul	0.8	2009	Ministry of Culture and Tourism, Istanbul Film Industry Report	
Johannesburg	1.3	2007	National Film and Video Foundation	
London	5.3	2011	BFI Statistical Yearbook 2011	
Mumbai	0.9	2011	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
Paris	4.9	2010	CNC	
São Paulo	4.4	2011	Organização Filme B	
Shanghai	1	2010	SCY2011	
Singapore	4.4	2011	Monthly Digest of Statistics Singapore	
Sydney	4.8	2010	Screen Australia/BOP Consulting	Figure estimated from Sydney cinema attendance rate and Sydney cinema attendance frequency
Tokyo	2.2	2010	Industrial Statistics Office, Research and Statistics Department, Economic and Industrial Policy Bureau, Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
No. of admissions at main film festival				
Berlin	484,860	2011	Berlinale Official Website	Berlin Film Festival
Istanbul	150,000	2010	Cultural Economy Compendium Istanbul 2010	Istanbul Film Festival
Johannesburg	7,500	2011	VANSA	Tricontinental Film Festival
London	132,000	2010	BFI	BFI London Film Festival
Mumbai	100,000	2011	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	Mumbai Film Festival
New York	410,000	2010	2011 Tribeca Film Festival Fact Sheet	Tribeca Film Festival
Paris	151,800	2011	Région Ile-de-France	Festival Cinéma en plein air au Parc de la Villette
São Paulo	250,000	2011	SP Cinema Festival	Sao Paulo International Film Festival
Shanghai	260,000	2010	Shanghai Yearbook 2011	Shanghai International Film Festival
Sydney	110,000	2011	If	Sydney Film Festival
Tokyo	121,010	2010	TIFFCOM 2010 Market Report	Tokyo International Film Festival
Total value of cinema ticket sales per year – \$ (ppp)				
Berlin	\$80,784,465	2011	Filmförderungsanstalt	
Istanbul	\$75,685,429	2009	Ministry of Culture and Tourism, Istanbul Film Industry Report	
Johannesburg	\$102,724,956	2011	PricewaterhouseCoopers	Figure estimated from national figure
London	\$363,300,448	2010	BFI Statistical Yearbook 2011	
Mumbai	\$81,200,553	2011	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
Paris	\$416,083,793	2010	CNC	
São Paulo	\$281,214,848	2011	Organização Filme B	
Shanghai	\$238,196,000	2010	Shanghai Yearbook 2011	
Singapore	\$156,094,945	2010	Singapore Film Commission	
Sydney	\$156,918,900	2011	Screen Australia & Australian Bureau of Statistics	Figure estimated from regional figure
Tokyo	\$351,024,091	2010	Industrial Statistics Office, Research and Statistics Department, Economic and Industrial Policy Bureau, Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry / NLI Research Institute	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
Total value of cinema ticket sales per capita per year – \$ (ppp)				
Berlin	\$23	2011	Filmförderungsanstalt	
Istanbul	\$6	2009	Ministry of Culture and Tourism, Istanbul Film Industry Report	
Johannesburg	\$9	2011	PricewaterhouseCoopers	Figure estimated from national figure
London	\$46	2010	BFI Statistical Yearbook 2011	
Mumbai	\$3.46	2011	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
Paris	\$6	2010	CNC	
São Paulo	\$25	2011	Organização Filme B	
Shanghai	\$10	2010	Shanghai Yearbook 2011	
Singapore	\$31	2010	Singapore Film Commission	
Sydney	\$34	2011	Screen Australia & Australian Bureau of Statistics	Figure estimated from regional figure
Tokyo	\$27	2010	Industrial Statistics Office, Research and Statistics Department, Economic and Industrial Policy Bureau, Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry / NLI Research Institute	
Estimated attendance at main carnival/festival				
Berlin	1,360,000	2011	Karneval der Kulturen Official Website	Karneval der Kulturen
Johannesburg	67,829	2011	COJ Report: November 2011	Arts Alive
London	1,500,000	2011	Metropolitan Police	Notting Hill Carnival
Mumbai	2,000,000	2011	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	Ganesha Utsav
New York	2,500,000	2010	Macy's	Macy's Thanksgiving Day Parade
Paris	1,500,000	2010	CRT Paris-Ile-de-France	Nuit Blanche
São Paulo	4,000,000	2012	SP Turis	Carnaval
Shanghai	3,060,000	2010	SCY2011	Shanghai International Arts Festival
Sydney	653,000	2011	Sydney Festival Annual Review 2011	Sydney Festival
Tokyo	1,270,000	2010	Taito City	Sanja Matsuri

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
Estimated attendance at main carnival / festival as % of city population				
Berlin	39.6%	2011	Karneval der Kulturen Official Website	Karneval der Kulturen
Johannesburg	0.6%	2011	COJ Report: November 2011	Arts Alive
London	19%	2011	Metropolitan Police	Notting Hill Carnival
Mumbai	16.09%	2011	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	Ganesha Utsav
New York	30%	2010	Macy's	Macy's Thanksgiving Day Parade
Paris	13%	2010	CRT Paris-Ile-de-France	Nuit Blanche
São Paulo	36%	2012	SP Turis	Carnaval
Shanghai	13%	2010	SCY2011	Shanghai International Arts Festival
Sydney	14.27%	2011	Sydney Festival Annual Review 2011	Sydney Festival
Tokyo	9.65%	2010	Taito City	Sanja Matsuri
No. of international tourists per year				
Berlin	2,871,000	2010	Amt für Statistik Berlin-Brandenburg	
Istanbul	8,057,879	2011	Istanbul Provincial Directorate of Culture and Tourism	
Johannesburg	3,988,335	2010	Gauteng Tourism Authority	
London	15,216,000	2011	Office for National Statistics	
Mumbai	2,195,000	2010	Euromonitor International's top city destinations ranking (2012)	
New York	8,380,000	2011	NYC & Co.	
Paris	13,300,000	2010	CRT Paris-Ile-de-France	
São Paulo	1,600,000	2011	SPTuris	
Shanghai	8,511,200	2010	SCY2011	
Singapore	11,641,700	2010	Department of Statistics Singapore	
Sydney	2,610,000	2010	Destination NSW	
Tokyo	5,940,000	2010	Tokyo Metropolitan Government, Bureau of Industrial and Labor Affairs	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
No. of international tourists per year as % of city population				
Berlin	82.99%	2010	Amt für Statistik Berlin-Brandenburg	
Istanbul	59.1%	2011	Istanbul Provincial Directorate of Culture and Tourism	
Johannesburg	35.2%	2010	Gauteng Tourism Authority	
London	194.45%	2011	Office for National Statistics	
Mumbai	17.65%	2010	Euromonitor International's top city destinations ranking (2012)	
New York	102.51%	2011	NYC & Co.	
Paris	112.74%	2010	CRT Paris-Ile-de-France	
São Paulo	14%	2011	SPTuris	
Shanghai	36.26%	2010	SCY2011	
Singapore	224.58%	2010	Department of Statistics Singapore	
Sydney	57.04%	2010	Destination NSW	
Tokyo	45.1%	2010	Tokyo Metropolitan Government, Bureau of Industrial and Labor Affairs	

World cities contextual data

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
Geographical area size, sq. km				
Berlin	892	2010	Statistisches Bundesamt Deutschland	
Germany	357,124	2010	Statistisches Bundesamt Deutschland	
Istanbul	5,313	2010	Turkey's 2010 Statistical Yearbook	
Turkey	785,347	2010	Turkey's 2010 Statistical Yearbook	
Johannesburg	18,178	2012	VANSA	
South Africa	1,221,037	2012	VANSA	
London	1,572	2011	Office for National Statistics	
United Kingdom	242,560	2011	Office for National Statistics	
Mumbai	437.1	2012	Brihanmumbai Municipal Corporation Diary 2012	
India	3,287,263	2011	Government of India	
New York	1,214.40	2010	U.S. Census Bureau	
United States	3,531,905.43	2010	U.S. Census Bureau	
Paris	12,012	2012	IAU Ile-de-France	
France	543,965	2012	IAU Ile-de-France	
São Paulo	1,500	2011	Censo	
Brazil	8,514,877	2012	Censo	
Shanghai	6340.5	2010	Shanghai Yearbook 2011	
China	9,600,000	2010	National Bureau of Statistics of China (NBS)	
Singapore	710	2012	Department of Statistics Singapore	
Sydney	12,144.50	2006	Australian Bureau of Statistics	
Australia	7,617,930	2006	Australian Bureau of Statistics	
Tokyo	2,130	2012	Japan Statistical Yearbook 2012	
Japan	377,950	2012	Japan Statistical Research and Training Institute, Ministry of Internal Affairs and Communications (MIAC)	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
Total population number				
Berlin	3,460,725	2010	Amt für Statistik Berlin-Brandenburg	
Germany	81,752,000	2010	Statistisches Bundesamt Deutschland	
Istanbul	13,624,240	2011	Turkish Statistical Institute	
Turkey	74,724,269	2011	Turkish Statistical Institute	
Johannesburg	11,328,203	2011	StatSA Mid Year Population Estimates 2011	
South Africa	50,586,757	2011	StatSA Mid Year Population Estimates 2011	
London	7,825,200	2010	Office for National Statistics	
United Kingdom	62,262,000	2010	Office for National Statistics	
Mumbai	12,432,830	2011	Brihanmumbai Municipal Corporation Diary 2012	
India	1,210,193,422	2011	Census 2011	
New York	8,175,133	2010	U.S. Census Bureau	
United States	308,745,538	2010	U.S. Census Bureau	
Paris	11,797,021	2010	Insee	
France	62,791,013	2010	Insee	
São Paulo	11,253,503	2011	Censo	
Brazil	198,000,000	2012	Censo	
Shanghai	23,474,600	2011	SMSB	
China	1,339,724,852	2010	NBS	
Singapore	5,183,700	2011	Department of Statistics Singapore	
Sydney	4,575,532	2010	Australian Bureau of Statistics	
Australia	22,342,000	2010	Australian Bureau of Statistics	
Tokyo	13,159,388	2010	Japan Statistical Yearbook 2012	
Japan	128,057,352	2010	Japan Statistical Research and Training Institute, Ministry of Internal Affairs and Communications (MIAC)	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
% of total national country population living in the city				
Berlin	4.23%	2010	Amt für Statistik Berlin-Brandenburg	
Istanbul	18.23%	2011	Turkish Statistical Institute	
Johannesburg	22.4%	2011	StatSA Mid Year Population Estimates 2011	
London	12.65%	2010	Office for National Statistics	
Mumbai	1.03%	2011	Based on Census of India 2011 data	
New York	2.65%	2010	U.S. Census Bureau	
Paris	18.8%	2010	Insee, estimations de population	
São Paulo	5.68%	2011	Censo	
Shanghai	1.75%	2010	NBS	
Singapore	100%	2011	Department of Statistics Singapore	
Sydney	20.48%	2010	Australian Bureau of Statistics	
Tokyo	10.28%	2010	Japan Statistical Yearbook 2012	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
Working age population				
Berlin	2,297,921	2010	Amt für Statistik Berlin-Brandenburg	
Germany	51,418,800	2010	Statistisches Bundesamt Deutschland	
Istanbul	10,420,392	2011	Turkish Statistical Institute	
Turkey	55,837,694	2011	Turkish Statistical Institute	
Johannesburg	6,833,217	2011	StatSA Mid Year Population Estimates 2011	
South Africa	27,060,086	2011	StatSA Mid Year Population Estimates 2011	
London	3,851,000	2010	Office for National Statistics	
United Kingdom	29,279,000	2011	Office for National Statistics	
Mumbai	8,643,303	2001	Census of India	
India	721,396,299	2001	Census of India	
New York	5,420,114	2010	U.S. Census Bureau	
United States	194,509,689	2010	U.S. Census Bureau	
Paris	7,250,499	2010	Insee	
France	36,861,457	2010	Insee	
São Paulo	6,720,000	2011	Censo	
Brazil	113,256,000	2012	Censo	
Shanghai	17,563,800	2010	SMSB	
China	939,683,011	2010	NBS	
Singapore	2,297,921	2010	Amt für Statistik Berlin-Brandenburg	
Sydney	3,157,117	2010	Australian Bureau of Statistics	
Australia	15,080,850	2010	Australian Bureau of Statistics	
Tokyo	8,739,000	2010	Japan Statistical Yearbook 2012	
Japan	80,731,000	2010	Japan Statistical Research and Training Institute, Ministry of Internal Affairs and Communications (MIAC)	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
No. of households				
Berlin	1,988,500	2010	Amt für Statistik Berlin-Brandenburg	
Germany	40,301,000	2010	Statistisches Bundesamt Deutschland	
Istanbul	2,550,607	2000	Turkey's 2010 Statistical Yearbook	
Turkey	15,070,093	2000	Turkey's 2010 Statistical Yearbook	
Johannesburg	3,175,579	2007	Statssa: Community Survey 2007	
South Africa	12,500,609	2007	Statssa: Community Survey 2007	
London	3,109,657	2001	Census of Population 2001, Office for National Statistics	
United Kingdom	26,258,000	2011	Office for National Statistics	
Mumbai	2,515,589	2011	Census of India	
India	192,671,808	2001	Census of India	
New York	3,047,249	2010	U.S. Census Bureau	
United States	114,235,996	2010	U.S. Census Bureau	
Paris	4,897,435	2008	Insee recensement de la population 2008	
France	26,614,970	2008	Insee recensement de la population 2008	
São Paulo	3,928,331	2011	Censo	
Brazil	59,500,000	2011	Censo	
Shanghai	8,251,200	2010	SMSB	
China	401,520,000	2010	NBS	
Singapore	1,146,200	2011	Department of Statistics Singapore	
Sydney	1,423,521	2006	Australian Bureau of Statistics	
Australia	7,144,096	2006	Australian Bureau of Statistics	
Tokyo	6,327,000	2010	Japan Statistical Yearbook 2012	
Japan	50,928,100	2010	Japan Statistical Research and Training Institute, Ministry of Internal Affairs and Communications (MIAC)	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
Foreign born population %				
Berlin	13.23%	2010	Amt für Statistik Berlin-Brandenburg	
Germany	8.26%	2010	Statistisches Bundesamt Deutschland	
Turkey	1.9%	2010	UN	
Johannesburg	5.7%	2007	Statssa: Community Survey 2007	
South Africa	2.7%	2007	Statssa: Community Survey 2007	
London	30.8%	2010	Migration Observatory	
United Kingdom	12%	2010	Migration Observatory	
Mumbai	1.4%	2001	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
India	0.52%	2005	UNESCAP Statistical Yearbook for Asia and the Pacific 2009	
New York	36.8%	2010	U.S. Census Bureau	
United States	12.7%	2010	U.S. Census Bureau	
Paris	12.4%	2008	Insee	
France	5.8%	2008	Insee	
Shanghai	0.89%	2010	NBS/STA	
China	0.08%	2010	NBS/STA	
Singapore	26.9%	2011	Department of Statistics Singapore	
Sydney	34.4%	2006	Australian Bureau of Statistics	
Australia	23.8%	2006	Australian Bureau of Statistics	
Tokyo	2.42%	2010	2010 Population Census of Japan	
Japan	1.29%	2010	Japan Statistical Research and Training Institute, Ministry of Internal Affairs and Communications (MIAC) / NLI Research Institute	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
Education level – % with degree level or higher				
Berlin	39%	2010	Bildung in Berlin und Brandenburg 2010	
Germany	28.4%	2010	Bildung in Berlin und Brandenburg 2010	
Istanbul	9.23%	2010	Turkish Statistical Institute	
Turkey	11.8%	2010	Turkish Statistical Institute	
Johannesburg	32%	2010	State of the Cities Report 2011	
South Africa	24%	2010	State of the Cities Report 2011	
London	41.9%	2010	Office for National Statistics	
United Kingdom	31.2%	2010	Office for National Statistics	
Mumbai	N/A			
India	3.7%	2001	Census of India	
New York	33.3%	2010	U.S. Census Bureau	
United States	27.9%	2010	U.S. Census Bureau	
Paris	35.84%	2008	Insee	
France	28.57%	2008	Insee	
São Paulo	19%	2011	Censo	
Brazil	12%	2009	OECD	
Shanghai	42.92%	2010	SMSB	
China	14.03%	2010	NBS	
Singapore	22.8%	2010	Department of Statistics Singapore	
Sydney	34.96%	2006	Australian Bureau of Statistics	
Australia	33.7%	2006	Australian Bureau of Statistics	
Tokyo	25.5%	2010	Population Census of Japan	
Japan	17.64%	2010	Japan Statistical Research and Training Institute, Ministry of Internal Affairs and Communications (MIAC) / NLI Research Institute	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
Average income per capita per year (ppp)				
Berlin	\$14,544	2009	Amt für Statistik Berlin-Brandenburg	
Germany	\$18,681	2009	Amt für Statistik Berlin-Brandenburg	
Istanbul	\$10,576	2007	Turkey's 2010 Statistical Yearbook	
Turkey	\$7,433	2007	Turkey's 2010 Statistical Yearbook	
Johannesburg	\$11,591	2009	State of the Cities Report 2011	
South Africa	\$7,165	2009	State of the Cities Report 2011	
London	\$45,094	2010	Greater London Authority Income and Spending at Home Report	
United Kingdom	\$38,715	2010	Office for National Statistics	
Mumbai	\$6,839	2010	Economic Survey of Maharashtra 2010/2011	
India	\$2,416	2010	Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation	
New York	\$30,498	2010	U.S. Census Bureau	
United States	\$27,334	2010	U.S. Census Bureau	
Paris	\$26,497	2008	Insee	
France	\$22,154	2008	Insee	
São Paulo	\$14,160	2011	Censo	
Brazil	\$11,600	2011	Censo	
Shanghai	\$5,472	2011	Xinhua Net	
China	\$3,294	2011	CINIC	
Singapore	\$47,180	2010	Singapore Yearbook of Statistics 2011	
Sydney	\$33,285	2009	Australian Bureau of Statistics	
Australia	\$29,643	2009	Australian Bureau of Statistics	
Tokyo	\$55,766	2011	Basic Survey on Wage Structure 2011	
Japan	\$44,085	2011	Wages and Labour Welfare Statistics Division, Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare / NLI Research Institute	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
Median gross weekly earnings (ppp)				
Istanbul	\$108	2007	Turkey's 2010 Statistical Yearbook	
Turkey	\$159	2007	Turkey's 2010 Statistical Yearbook	
Johannesburg	\$184	2010	StatSA: Monthly Earnings of South Africans, 2010 (Labour Force Survey)	
South Africa	\$140	2010	StatSA: Monthly Earnings of South Africans, 2010 (Labour Force Survey)	
London	\$960	2010	Annual Survey of Hours and Earnings, Office for National Statistics	
United Kingdom	\$745	2010	Annual Survey of Hours and Earnings, Office for National Statistics	
New York	\$967	2010	U.S. Census Bureau	
United States	\$998	2010	U.S. Census Bureau	
Paris	\$513	2009	Insee	
France	\$446	2009	Insee	
São Paulo	\$262	2011	Censo	
Brazil	\$214	2011	Censo	
Shanghai	\$105	2011	Xinhua net/STA	
China	\$63	2011	CINIC/STA	
Singapore	\$696	2012	Singapore Comprehensive Labour Force Survey	
Sydney	\$962	2008	Australian Bureau of Statistics	
Australia	\$657	2011	Australian Bureau of Statistics	
Tokyo	\$1,070	2011	Basic Survey on Wage Structure 2011	
Japan	\$846	2011	Wages and Labour Welfare Statistics Division, Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare / NLI Research Institute	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
GDP (ppp) (million)				
Berlin	\$80,000	2010	Amt für Statistik Berlin-Brandenburg	
Germany	\$3,280,500	2010	World Bank	
Istanbul	\$182,000	2008	PricewaterhouseCoopers	
Turkey	\$678,913	2010	World Bank	
Johannesburg	\$175,956	2011	StatSA report: P0441 – Gross Domestic Product (GDP), 3rd Quarter 2011	
South Africa	\$521,748	2011	StatSA report: P0441 – Gross Domestic Product (GDP), 3rd Quarter 2011	
London	\$565,000	2008	PricewaterhouseCoopers	
United Kingdom	\$3,357,399	2010	World Bank	
Mumbai	\$209,000	2008	PricewaterhouseCoopers	
India	\$3,197,826	2010	World Bank	
New York	\$1,406,000	2008	PricewaterhouseCoopers	
United States	\$14,586,700	2010	World Bank	
Paris	\$605,985	2009	Insee	
France	\$2,054,371	2009	Insee	
São Paulo	\$370,000	2011	Prefeitura de São Paulo	
Brazil	\$2,284,000	2011	World Bank	
Shanghai	\$289,899	2011	SMSB	
China	\$7,128,290	2011	Government Work Report of Year 2012	
Singapore	\$311,566	2011	Department of Statistics Singapore	
Sydney	\$213,000	2008	PricewaterhouseCoopers	
Australia	\$924,843	2010	World Bank	
Tokyo	\$743,826	2009	Annual Report on Prefectural Accounts	
Japan	\$4,218,873	2009	Economic and Social Research Institute, Cabinet Office, Government of Japan	

City	Figure	Date	Source	Notes
Creative industries employment				
Berlin	7.5%	2006	Statistisches Bundesamt Deutschland	
Germany	2.3%	2006	Statistisches Bundesamt Deutschland	
Johannesburg	4.5%	2008	Gauteng Creative Industries Mapping report	
South Africa	N/A			
London	12%	2007	GLA London's Creative Sector	
United Kingdom	5.1%	2011	DCMS	
Mumbai	16.01%	2005	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
India	11.44%	2005	Tata Institute of Social Sciences	
New York	8%	2008	Americans for the Arts, Creative Industries 2008 The 50 City Report	
United States	4.5%	2008	Americans for the Arts, Creative Industries 2008 The 50 City Report	
Paris	8.8%	2008	IAU Ile-de-France/Insee	
France	3.93%	2008	IAU Ile-de-France/Insee	
Shanghai	7.38%	2010	Shanghai Economic Yearbook 2011	
Singapore	0.82%	2009	Singapore Cultural Statistics 2011 – Economic Contribution of the Arts and Cultural Sector	
Sydney	5.3%	2010	NSW Government	
Australia	3.8%	2006	Australian Bureau of Statistics	
Tokyo	11.2%	2006	Yoshimoto, M. (2009) 'Creative Industry Trends – The Creative-Industry Profiles of Japan's Ordinance- Designated Cities', NLI Research Report	
Japan	4%	2006	NLI Research Institute	

Appendix 3: Shanghai Symposium

Friday, 20 April

9–10am: Opening Session

- Wei Lou, Chairman of Shanghai Theatre Academy, Director of School Committee
- Jinhai Zhu, Deputy Director, The Development Research Centre of Shanghai Municipal People's Government
- Justine Simons, Head of Cultural Strategy, Greater London Authority
- Paul Owens, Director, BOP Consulting and WCCR
- Ping Yu, Director of Culture and Technology Department, Ministry of Culture, P.R. China

10–11.20am: Keynotes

Theme: Cultural Wealth of World Cities

- John Howkins, Visiting Professor, STA & BOP Associate
- Prof. Andy Pratt, King's College London
- Prof. Changyong Huang, Vice President, Shanghai Theatre Academy
- Kate D. Levin, Commissioner, Department of Cultural Affairs, New York City

11.40am–12.20pm: City Presentations (1)

- *Tokyo, A Future Model for a Creative City:* Yusaku Imamura, Counselor on special issues to the Governor, Tokyo Metropolitan Government
- *Paris, A combination of a Rich Cultural Heritage and Vibrant Culture:* Odile Soulard & Carine Camors, IAU Ile-de-France Economist Regional and Economic Local Department

Saturday, 21 April

2–3.20pm: City Presentations (2)

- *London, A Summer Like No Other?:* Justine Simons, Head of Cultural Strategy, Greater London Authority
- *Cultural and Creative industries in Mumbai: Potential and Challenges:* Prof. Abdul Shaban, Centre for Development Studies, Tata Institute of Social Sciences

3.50–5.30pm: City Presentations (3)

- *Shanghai, A Melting Pot of East and West for Cultural Metropolis:* Dr. Marina Guo, Shanghai Theatre Academy
- *Istanbul Cultural Review:* Esma Firuze Küyük, Assistant Expert of Culture & Tourism, Istanbul Office of the Ministry of Culture and Tourism

9–10.20am: City Presentations (4)

- *New York City and the World Cities Culture Report:* Donna Keren, Senior Vice President, Research and Analysis, NYC & Company
- *Rethinking Cultural Infrastructure in an Afropolitan Context – The Case of Johannesburg and the Gauteng City-Region:* Joseph Gaylard, Director of Visual Arts Network of South Africa, Johannesburg office

10.50–11.50am: Planning Session for World Cities Culture Forum

11.50am–12pm: Closing Session for Shanghai Symposium

The Shanghai Symposium was organised by BOP Consulting and Shanghai Theatre Academy. The Shanghai Symposium was hosted and sponsored by the Shanghai Theatre Academy Metropolitan Cultural Audit Centre.



opposite: Shanghai Symposium 2012 STA/BOP

Appendix 4: List of policy questions

1. What are the key agencies involved in your city's cultural policymaking (government at different territorial levels, other public sector bodies, economic development agencies, private organisations, etc.)
[Please list the most important players within your city and briefly explain their roles. 200 words max.]
2. In order of priority, what are the main drivers of your city's cultural policy? And are these priorities reflected in your country's national policy?
 - Value of cultural participation
 - Heritage
 - Tourism
 - Economic development
 - Social development
 - Diplomacy/cultural exchange
 - City marketing
 - Nation-building
 - Other (please specify)
[Please rank the above items in order of priority. Please also provide a brief commentary to explain your priorities. 500 words max.]
3. What are the key developments within the cultural sector in your city that are taking place now or are planned for the near future? This could be in terms of:
 - cultural infrastructure (includes both buildings and institutions)
 - festival/events programmes
 - support programmes for cultural workforce
 - other
[Please provide a brief description of the key developments for the areas listed above (if relevant) or any others. 200 words max.]
4. Are there any major initiatives or events (e.g. Olympic Games, Expo, UNESCO designation, European Capital of Culture designation etc) in your city that take place now or in the near future? If yes, why do you think these will impact on the overall cultural offer and participation in your city?
[Please provide a brief commentary. 200 words max.]
5. What role do 'informal, fringe' activities play within your city's cultural life? (e.g. photo exhibitions in cafes). And how important do you consider this contribution made by this 'fringe' economy compared to the 'formal' cultural sector?
[Please provide a brief commentary and a list of examples of the kind of informal, fringe activities that are particularly important in your city.
500 words max.]
6. How are you securing the long-term, sustainable development of the cultural sector?
[Please provide a brief commentary on the key areas that you focus on or which need support in terms of developing a more sustainable cultural sector. 500 words max.]
7. What do you consider as the key cultural assets of your city? (Assets does not exclusively refer to cultural infrastructure, but could equally include workforce, sub-sectors, structures, organisations, processes)
[Please provide a brief commentary. 300 words max.]

8. What are the key challenges to developing your city's cultural assets? (economic, social, organisational/governmental, political)
[Please provide a brief commentary.
500 words max.]

9. What do you consider as unique to your city's cultural offer?
[Please provide us with one key feature that you consider unique and provide a brief explanation for your choice. This could refer to a particular event or initiative, or another element of cultural life/sector.
200 words max.]

The *World Cities Culture Report 2012* is a major new global initiative on culture and the future of cities, which was initiated by the Mayor of London and the Greater London Authority.

The *World Cities Cultural Audit 2012* Symposium was sponsored by the Shanghai Theatre Academy, Metropolitan Cultural Audit Centre.

This report has been prepared by BOP Consulting (www.bop.co.uk):
Paul Owens
Chris Gibbon
Ulrike Chouguley
Matthieu Prin
Richard Naylor

In collaboration with:
Prof. Andy Pratt (King's College London)
Prof. Kate Oakley (University of Leeds)

This report has also benefited from the invaluable support of our project advisors:
Alan Freeman (London Metropolitan University)
Prof. Changyong Huang (Shanghai Theatre Academy)
Dave Adam (Global Cities)
John Howkins

BOP would like to thank the British Council, particularly the local offices in the partner cities, for their advice and support

The report has been produced in collaboration with our project partners:



© Mayor of London

ISBN: 978-1-84781-515-6

MAYOR OF LONDON



Other formats and languages

For a large print, Braille, disc, sign language video or audio-tape version of this document, please contact us at the address below:

Public Liaison Unit

Greater London Authority
City Hall, The Queen's Walk
More London, London SE1 2AA

Telephone 020 7983 4100
Minicom 020 7983 4458
www.london.gov.uk

You will need to supply your name, your postal address and state the format and title of the publication you require.

If you would like a summary of this document in your language, please phone the number or contact us at the address above.

Chinese

如果您需要您所說語言的此文件，
請以中文或英文郵件或電話聯絡

Vietnamese

Nếu bạn muốn có văn bản tài liệu này bằng ngôn ngữ của mình, hãy liên hệ theo số điện thoại hoặc địa chỉ dưới đây.

Greek

Αν θέλετε να αποκτήσετε αντίγραφο του παρόντος εγγράφου στη δική σας γλώσσα, παρακαλείστε να επικοινωνήσετε τηλεφωνικά στον αριθμό αυτό ή ταχυδρομικά στην παρακάτω διεύθυνση.

Turkish

Bu belgenin kendi dilinizde hazırlanmış bir nüshasını edinmek için, lütfen aşağıdaki telefon numarasını arayınız veya adresе başvurunuz.

Punjabi

ਜੇ ਕੁਝੂ ਇਸ ਦਸਤਾਵੇਜ਼ ਦੀ ਕਾਪੀ ਤੁਹਾਡੀ ਅਖਣੀ ਭਾਸ਼ਾ ਵਿਚ ਚਾਹੀਦੀ ਹੋ, ਤਾਂ ਹੇਠ ਲਿਖੇ ਨੰਘਰ ਤੋਂ ਫੋਨ ਕਰੋ ਜਾਂ ਹੇਠ ਲਿਖੇ ਪਤੇ 'ਤੇ ਰਾਖਦਾ ਕਰੋ

Hindi

यदि आप इस दस्तावेज की प्रति अपनी भाषा में चाहते हैं, तो कृपया निम्नलिखित नम्र पर फोन करें अथवा नीचे दिये गए पते पर संपर्क करें

Bengali

দাপ্তরিক যন্তি আপনার ভাষায় এই দস্তাবেজ প্রাপ্তিশীল
(কলা) জন, ঢাকলা মেট্রো দক্ষান নম্বৰ
১০ ঠিকানায় অনুশৃঙ্খ করে যোগাযোগ করুন।

Urdu

اگر آپ اس دستاویز کی نقل اپنی زبان میں
چاہتے ہیں، تو براہ کرہ فوجے دنیے گئے نمبر
بر فون کریں یا دیسے گئے پسے بر رابطہ کریں

Arabic

إذا أردت نسخة من هذه الوثيقة بلغتك، يرجى
الاتصال برقم الهاتف أو مرسلة العنوان
أعلاه

Gujarati

જો તમને આ દસ્તાવેજની નકલ તમારી ભાષામાં જોઈતી લોધ તો, કૃપા કરી આપેલ નંબર ઉપર
ફોન કરો અથવા નીચેના સરનામે સંપર્ક સાચ્ચા.

Berlin

Istanbul

Johannesburg

London

Mumbai

New York

Paris

São Paulo

Shanghai

Singapore

Sydney

Tokyo